

REVIEW
of the official reviewer on the dissertation of Olzhebayeva Gulbakhyt Serikovna
entitled “Mechanisms of human capital capacity management of higher education system of Kazakhstan in the context of green
transition”, for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – “Management”

№ п/п	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of official reviewer's position (comments in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	1.1. Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs: <u>1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or targeted program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</u> 2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program); 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)	The topic of the dissertation corresponds to the priority area of scientific development, “Intellectual potential of the country,” as well as to the provisions of the state programmes and strategic documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan aimed at human capital development, modernization of the higher education system, and ensuring sustainable and green development. In particular, the dissertation topic is consistent with the provisions of the Concept for the development of higher education and science in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023–2029, the Concept for the transition of the Republic of Kazakhstan to a green economy, and the Strategy for achieving carbon neutrality of the Republic of Kazakhstan by 2060. The dissertation topic is also related to the objectives outlined in the Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan K.-J. Tokayev to the people of Kazakhstan dated September 8, 2025, “Kazakhstan in the era of artificial intelligence: current challenges and their solutions through digital transformation,” which notes that the large-scale digital modernization of the economy imposes new requirements on human capital development, the training of qualified specialists, and the improvement of the education system. In addition, the results of the PhD candidate's dissertation research were used in the implementation of the research project under programme-targeted funding BR24992974 “Modernization of the higher education quality assurance system in Kazakhstan based on digitalization: development of approaches, mechanisms and an information base” for 2024–2026, funded from the state budget. In particular, the project used results related to the modernization of the higher education system, digital transformation, and the improvement of management mechanisms (implementation act).
2.	Importance for science	The work <u>does</u> /does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is <u>well - disclosed</u> /not disclosed	The dissertation research makes a significant contribution to the development of the theory and methodology of human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the “green” transition. The scientific significance of the research is determined by the systematization of modern theoretical approaches to human capital management, the development of the concept of green-oriented human capital, and the formation of a

			comprehensive approach to its development, taking into account the principles of sustainable development, ESG, and digital transformation. A significant scientific contribution is the development of new methodological and organizational-managerial solutions, including the systematization of higher education management models in the context of the "green" transition, the application of a comprehensive methodology for studying the factors of academic staff research productivity, as well as the substantiation of a multilevel model of interaction among participants in human capital development. The obtained results expand existing scientific understanding of the mechanisms for modernizing the higher education system and create a theoretical basis for further research in the field of human capital management and educational management. Overall, the dissertation represents a completed scientific study characterized by theoretical depth, scientific novelty, and practical significance, which makes it possible to assess it as a work that makes a significant contribution to the development of management science.
3.	Principle of autonomy	Level of autonomy: <u>1) high;</u> 2) medium; 3) low; 4) no independence.	The dissertation was completed independently by the doctoral student. The dissertation substantiates the scientific problem, aim, and objectives of the research, establishes the conceptual and methodological framework, and independently determines the methods of data collection, processing, and analysis. The PhD candidate's independent contribution is confirmed by the conduct of bibliometric and statistical analyses, a sociological survey and expert interviews, as well as by the interpretation of the obtained results. Based on the analysis conducted, an integrated model for human capital capacity management, a multilevel model of stakeholder interaction, and a set of organizational and managerial mechanisms for human capital development in the higher education system in the context of the green transition were developed. The obtained results, formulated conclusions, and practical recommendations demonstrate a high level of the PhD candidate's scientific independence.
4.	Principle of internal unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: <u>1) justified;</u> 2) partially justified; 3) not substantiated.	The relevance of the dissertation topic is convincingly substantiated by contemporary global and national challenges associated with the transition to sustainable development and a green economy. The PhD candidate provides a well-reasoned argument that the formation of human capital with environmental, digital, and interdisciplinary competencies is becoming one of the key conditions for sustainable development, while the higher education system plays a decisive role in this process. The PhD candidate reasonably links the research problem with the priorities of the state policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as established in strategic documents on the development of the "green" economy, the achievement of carbon neutrality, and the modernization of higher education. At the same time, a contradiction has been identified between the growing demand

	of the economy for a new quality of human capital and the insufficient development of mechanisms for managing its development in higher education institutions. The relevance of the research is confirmed by the analysis of international trends and the current state of the higher education system in Kazakhstan, which demonstrates the scientific and practical significance of the problem under consideration. Thus, the dissertation topic is relevant, and the necessity of the conducted research is fully substantiated.
4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic: <u>1) correspond to;</u> 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	The content of the dissertation corresponds to the stated topic and demonstrates a high degree of internal coherence and structural integrity. The research is organized in such a way as to ensure a consistent transition from the theoretical and methodological foundations of human capital management to a comprehensive analysis of the current state of the higher education system in Kazakhstan and, subsequently, to the development of organizational and managerial mechanisms aimed at human capital development in the context of the green transition. The first chapter establishes the theoretical and methodological foundations of the research through an analysis of the evolution of human capital concepts, contemporary approaches to human capital management in the higher education system, as well as the role of sustainable development, ESG principles, and the green transition in the transformation of universities. The inclusion of international experience and comparative analysis strengthens the conceptual framework of the research and ensures its alignment with current global trends. The second chapter presents a comprehensive analysis of the current state of the higher education system in Kazakhstan and the factors determining human capital development. It examines the institutional conditions of university functioning, the research productivity of academic staff, and issues related to the development of green competencies. The empirical part of the research, based on bibliometric analysis, a sociological survey, expert interviews, and statistical analysis, directly contributes to addressing the research objectives and substantiates the need to improve the existing human capital management mechanisms. The third chapter develops practical and strategic solutions, including an integrated model for human capital capacity management, a multilevel model of stakeholder interaction, and recommendations for modernizing the higher education system in the context of the green transition. The proposed developments logically follow from the theoretical provisions and the results of the empirical research and are aimed at addressing the identified problems in the human capital management system. The interrelationship between the chapters is clearly maintained, and each section contributes to achieving the overall aim of the research. The dissertation demonstrates consistency in the use of the conceptual framework, methodological approaches, and analytical tools, ensuring its internal unity, logical completeness, and full correspondence with the stated research topic.

	4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation: <u>1) correspond to;</u> 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond	The aim of the research corresponds to the dissertation topic and reflects its scientific focus. The research objectives are formulated consistently and cover all the main stages of the research—from theoretical analysis and the study of international experience to the assessment of the current state of the research object, identification of existing problems, and development of organizational and managerial solutions. The logic of the research objectives ensures the consistent exploration of the research topic and the achievement of the stated aim. Their content corresponds to the structure of the dissertation, and the results of each objective are reflected in the relevant sections of the dissertation. The interrelationship between the aim, objectives, and obtained scientific results can be traced throughout the research, demonstrating the internal logic and completeness of the dissertation.
	4.4 All sections and statements of the dissertation are logically interrelated: <u>1) fully interrelated;</u> 2) partially interrelated; 3) do not interrelated	The dissertation is characterized by a high level of internal logic and consistency of presentation. All sections of the dissertation are fully interconnected and directed towards achieving a single research aim. The theoretical provisions of the first chapter serve as the methodological basis for conducting the empirical research, the results of which are consistently used in the development of organizational and managerial mechanisms and practical recommendations. The structure of the dissertation is logically organized: from the analysis of theoretical approaches and international experience, the author consistently proceeds to an assessment of the current state of the higher education system in Kazakhstan, the identification of key problems in human capital management, and the development of proposals for addressing them. The obtained results are interconnected, consistently develop the main provisions of the research, and support the formulated conclusions. The interrelationship between the sections is ensured by the unity of the aim, objectives, methodological approaches, and analytical tools used. The dissertation represents a coherent and logically complete study in which all chapters and key provisions are consistent with one another and systematically address the research topic.
	4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are substantiated and evaluated in comparison with known solutions: <u>1) there is critical analysis</u> 2) the analysis is partial; 3) the analysis does not represent personal opinions,	The dissertation provides a reasoned assessment of the theoretical and applied approaches relevant to human capital management in higher education. Particular attention is given to determining whether established management concepts adequately address the changes associated with sustainable development, ESG principles, digital transformation, and the development of green competencies. The analysis demonstrates the need for a broader managerial framework capable of integrating these dimensions within the higher education system. On this basis, the PhD candidate substantiates organizational and managerial solutions that combine institutional, educational, managerial, digital, and sustainability-related components. Their development is

		but rather quotes from other authors; 4) no analysis	supported by the theoretical framework and empirical findings of the dissertation and represents a further development of existing approaches to human capital management. The comparison with established approaches and the consistent connection between the identified research gaps and the proposed solutions provide sufficient grounds to consider the author's approach scientifically substantiated.
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).	The scientific results and provisions presented in the dissertation are completely novel, as they are aimed at addressing the current scientific problem of human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition. The novelty of the research lies in the development of theoretical and methodological approaches to human capital management and the development of a set of organizational and managerial solutions that take into account the principles of sustainable development, ESG approaches, digital transformation, and contemporary requirements for human capital development. The scientific results are comprehensive in nature and further develop existing scientific approaches in relation to the current conditions of the higher education system in Kazakhstan. Their originality is confirmed by the development of an integrated approach to managing human capital development, a multilevel model of interaction among participants, and mechanisms for improving human capital management in the context of the "green" transition. The obtained results are characterized by conceptual integrity, methodological validity, and practical orientation. The use of a set of contemporary research methods ensured the achievement of new scientific results and enhanced the reliability of the conclusions drawn. The presented set of scientific results makes it possible to assess them as entirely novel and as making a significant contribution to the development of the theory and practice of human capital management in the higher education system.
		5.2 Are conclusions of the dissertation new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The conclusions of the dissertation are entirely novel, as they logically follow from the results of the theoretical and empirical research and reflect the author's approach to addressing the problem of human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition. Their novelty is determined not only by the scientific results obtained but also by their generalization in the form of an integrated system of organizational and managerial solutions focused on the principles of sustainable development, ESG approaches, and the development of green competencies. The conclusions are characterized by independence and internal logical consistency and are directly related to the aim and objectives of the research. They are based on the comprehensive application of contemporary research methods and reflect the author's vision of directions for improving human capital management in the higher education system, taking into account contemporary environmental, technological, and institutional challenges.

		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and justified: <u>1) completely new;</u> 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The conclusions obtained possess scientific novelty, have theoretical and practical significance, and can serve as a basis for the further development of research in the field of human capital management and modernization of the higher education system, which makes it possible to assess the dissertation conclusions as completely new. The dissertation proposes a set of organizational and managerial solutions that are entirely novel and scientifically substantiated. Their novelty lies in the development of a comprehensive approach to human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition, integrating contemporary management mechanisms, the principles of sustainable development, ESG approaches, and the development of green competencies. The proposed solutions are based on the results of comprehensive theoretical and empirical research, which confirms their scientific validity and practical applicability. The developed models and mechanisms logically follow from the research results, take into account the specific features of the higher education system in Kazakhstan, and are aimed at addressing current challenges in human capital development. The presented managerial solutions are characterized by internal consistency and practical orientation and can be used to improve the human capital management system of higher education institutions. This makes it possible to assess them as completely new and scientifically substantiated.
6.	Validity of the main conclusions	All key findings are <u>based/not</u> based on sound scientific evidence or are reasonably well substantiated (for qualitative research and arts and humanities majors)	All the main conclusions are based on reliable scientific evidence and are sufficiently substantiated. The main conclusions of the dissertation are based on the results of comprehensive theoretical and empirical research, which ensures their scientific reliability and internal consistency. The PhD candidate uses contemporary research methods that make it possible to comprehensively analyze the state and problems of human capital management in the higher education system, as well as to substantiate the proposed organizational and managerial solutions. The conclusions directly follow from the results of the conducted research, are supported by the empirical data obtained, and are consistent with the stated aim, objectives, and methodology of the research. Their validity is ensured by the use of complementary methods of analysis, objective interpretation of the results, and the logical consistency of the research. Overall, the main conclusions of the dissertation are scientifically substantiated, reliable, and supported by the combination of the theoretical and empirical results obtained.

7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	The following questions must be answered for each position separately: 7.1 Has the position been proven? <u>1) proven:</u> 2) most likely proven; 3) most likely not proven; 4) not proven; 5) in its current formulation, it is impossible to verify the provenness of the position. 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; <u>2) no:</u> 3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position. 7.3 Is it new? <u>1) yes:</u> 2) no; 3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position. 7.4 Level of application: 1) narrow; 2) medium; <u>3) wide:</u> 4) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify the level of application of the provision	Provision 1 The dissertation proposes the author's interpretation of the concept of "green-oriented human capital of universities," considered as a combination of knowledge, professional skills, interdisciplinary competencies, environmental values, and responsible behaviour patterns of students, faculty members, researchers, and administrative staff. The presented interpretation is based on a critical analysis of domestic and international studies, is characterized by scientific novelty, and expands existing understanding of human capital in relation to the conditions of the green transition. The proposed provision has a broad scope of applicability and is reflected in the PhD candidate's scientific publications. Provision 2 The PhD candidate has developed a typology of higher education system management models in the context of the green transition, taking into account the characteristics of the institutional environment, the level of management centralization, and mechanisms for integrating sustainable development principles. The presented typology is based on an analysis of international experience and the results of the PhD candidate's own research, is characterized by scientific novelty, and can be used in the development of public policy and university development strategies. The main provisions are reflected in the author's publications. Provision 3 The PhD candidate has proposed a combined methodology for assessing the factors of research productivity and the effectiveness of human capital management, based on the integration of statistical, sociological, and correlation analysis. The use of the combined research methodology made it possible to identify relationships between publication activity, institutional conditions, and mechanisms for stimulating research activities. The proposed methodological approach is independent in nature, possesses scientific novelty, and expands the possibilities for analysing the effectiveness of human capital management in universities. The obtained results have a broad scope of practical application and are supported by the PhD candidate's publications. Provision 4 The PhD candidate has developed a set of mechanisms for human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the green transition, including institutional, educational, managerial, infrastructural-digital, and social mechanisms. The proposed set is based on the results of theoretical and empirical research, possesses scientific novelty, and ensures the comprehensive development of universities' human capital. The developed mechanisms have a broad scope of practical application and are reflected in the author's scientific publications. Provision 5
----	---	---	--

		7.5 Is it proven in the article? <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no; 3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.	The PhD candidate has developed a roadmap for modernizing human capital management in universities in the context of the green transition, providing for the phased development of environmental, digital, managerial, and interdisciplinary competencies. The proposed roadmap is based on the research results and is oriented towards practical application in the implementation of university development strategies. The main provisions are reflected in the author's published scientific works.
8.	Principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 The choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail: <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The choice of research methodology is well substantiated and fully corresponds to the aim, objectives, and subject of the dissertation research. The PhD candidate used a set of complementary theoretical, quantitative, and qualitative methods that ensure a comprehensive study of the problem of human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition. The research methodology is presented consistently and in sufficient detail. The methods used are logically interconnected, correspond to the stated research objectives, and ensure the attainment of reliable and scientifically substantiated results. The combination of bibliometric, statistical, sociological, and correlation analyses and expert interviews demonstrates a comprehensive approach to the research and enhances the reliability of the conclusions obtained. Overall, the choice of methodology is well substantiated, and its description meets contemporary requirements for dissertation research in the field of "Management."
		8.2 The results of the dissertation were obtained using modern scientific research methods and data processing and interpretation techniques using computer technologies: <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The results of the dissertation research were obtained using contemporary scientific research methods, data processing and interpretation techniques, as well as computer technologies. The PhD candidate applied a set of complementary methods, including bibliometric, statistical, correlation, and comparative analyses, sociological research, and expert interviews, which ensures a comprehensive study of the research problem. Contemporary software tools were used for processing and analysing empirical data, providing statistical processing, bibliometric analysis, visualization, and interpretation of the research results. The use of computer technologies made it possible to enhance the objectivity of the analysis, the reliability of the obtained results, and the reproducibility of the calculations performed. The methods used fully correspond to the aim and objectives of the research, and their comprehensive application ensured the attainment of scientifically substantiated results and the development of organizational and managerial solutions aimed at improving human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition.

	8.3 The theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment): <u>1) yes</u> 2) no	The theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships, and patterns presented in the dissertation are confirmed by the results of the empirical research. The evidence obtained demonstrates the relationships between institutional conditions, human capital management practices, research productivity, and the development of green competencies in the higher education system. The empirical findings provide the basis for the theoretical conclusions and are consistently incorporated into the integrated model for human capital capacity management, the multilevel model of stakeholder interaction, and the proposed organizational and managerial mechanisms. This ensures a direct connection between the identified relationships and patterns and the models developed in the dissertation. Thus, the theoretical conclusions, identified relationships and patterns, and the proposed models are supported and substantiated by the empirical results of the research, which confirms their scientific validity.	
	8.4 Important claims are <u>supported</u>/partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature	The dissertation demonstrates a high level of reliability in terms of the scientific sources and information base used. The PhD candidate relies on a wide range of domestic and international scientific publications devoted to human capital management, higher education management, sustainable development, ESG approaches, the green transition, digital transformation, and human capital development. The use of both fundamental theoretical concepts and contemporary research provides a balanced and methodologically consistent foundation for the study. The key provisions and scientific statements presented in the dissertation are supported by references to authoritative domestic and international sources, demonstrating the PhD candidate's reliance on contemporary scientific achievements and recognized theoretical approaches. The literature review covers a wide range of issues, including theoretical, institutional, organizational, and managerial aspects of human capital development in the higher education system, which makes it possible to substantiate the selected research concept and determine its place in contemporary scientific discourse. Considerable attention is devoted to the analysis of international experience in managing universities' human capital in the context of sustainable development. The use of studies devoted to ESG, the development of green competencies, sustainable universities, and contemporary human capital management mechanisms strengthens the author's arguments and confirms the need to modernize the higher education system of Kazakhstan. At the same time, the PhD candidate critically analyses their possibilities and limitations in relation to the conditions of the national higher education system. The empirical part of the research is also based on reliable data, including the results of bibliometric analysis, statistical information, sociological research, expert interviews, and	

		8.5 The literature sources used are sufficient /not sufficient for a literature review.	analysis of regulatory documents. The applied methods of data processing and interpretation are transparent and methodologically substantiated, which enhances the reliability of the obtained results and supports the conclusions drawn. The sources used in the dissertation are relevant, scientifically reliable, and fully correspond to the research objectives. The PhD candidate demonstrates the ability to critically evaluate scientific literature, which further confirms the validity of the presented scientific provisions and conclusions. The literature sources used in the dissertation are sufficient to conduct a comprehensive and scientifically substantiated literature review. The PhD candidate relies on a wide range of domestic and international scientific publications reflecting the current state of research in the fields of human capital management, higher education management, sustainable development, ESG approaches, and the “green” transition. The literature review demonstrates a good knowledge of classical and contemporary scientific approaches, which made it possible to establish a consistent theoretical and methodological foundation for the research and determine the place of the dissertation in contemporary scientific discourse. The sources used are characterized by their relevance, scientific significance, and interdisciplinary nature, ensuring a comprehensive examination of the research problem. Overall, the literature base of the dissertation is sufficient to substantiate the theoretical provisions, select methodological approaches, and support the conclusions obtained.
9	Principle of practical value	9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance: 1) yes; 2) no	The dissertation demonstrates significant theoretical value through the development of a comprehensive and conceptually substantiated approach to human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the green transition. The dissertation expands existing scientific understanding of human capital management by considering it as an integrated system that combines strategic management mechanisms, sustainable development principles, ESG approaches, digital transformation, and the development of green competencies. The reconsideration of the role of human capital as a key resource for ensuring the sustainable development of the higher education system and for developing the human resources required for the green economy is of particular significance. The proposed approach expands existing theoretical perspectives by considering human capital capacity management as a comprehensive process based on the interrelationship between institutional, organizational, human resource, and research mechanisms. The research also expands the theoretical field by incorporating such elements as green competencies, research productivity of academic staff, ESG principles, digital transformation, and stakeholder interaction into a unified conceptual system. The proposed integrated model

			for human capital capacity management, multilevel model of stakeholder interaction, and stakeholder matrix reflect the PhD candidate's effort to integrate the strategic, organizational, and institutional aspects of human capital management within a unified theoretical concept. This approach strengthens the theoretical significance of the research and makes it possible to consider it as a contribution to the further development of the theory of human capital management and higher education management in the context of sustainable development.
	9.2 The dissertation has practical significance and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice: <u>1) yes;</u> 2) no	The practical significance of the dissertation is reflected in the development of a set of organizational and managerial mechanisms that can be directly used to improve the human capital management system of higher education institutions. The proposed integrated model for human capital capacity management, multilevel model of stakeholder interaction, and stakeholder matrix are not limited to a conceptual description but are presented as structured solutions oriented towards practical application in the higher education system of Kazakhstan. The recommendations formulated in the dissertation are oriented towards the actual institutional conditions in which universities operate and take into account contemporary requirements for sustainable development, digital transformation, and the transition to a green economy. The developed mechanisms for modernizing human capital management provide consistent directions for improving human resource policy, developing green competencies, increasing the research productivity of academic staff, and integrating ESG principles into the activities of higher education institutions, which enhances the feasibility of their practical implementation. The use of the results of bibliometric analysis, statistical research, a sociological survey, and expert interviews strengthens the applied orientation of the research, since the proposed solutions are based on the identified patterns of functioning of the higher education system rather than on abstract assumptions. The obtained results can be used in developing university development strategies, improving human capital management mechanisms, preparing state programmes and regulatory documents, as well as implementing sustainable development policies and modernizing the higher education system of Kazakhstan.	
	9.3 Are the practice offering new: <u>1) completely new;</u> 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new	The practical proposals presented in the dissertation possess scientific novelty and are comprehensive in nature. The PhD candidate has developed new managerial solutions, including an integrated model of human capital capacity management in the higher education system, recommendations for modernizing the higher education system and improving human capital management mechanisms in the context of the green transition, a multilevel model of interaction among participants in the process, and a stakeholder matrix for the implementation of green initiatives. The practical recommendations are based on the results of the PhD candidate's own research, take into account the specific features of the higher education system of Kazakhstan, and are	

			aimed at addressing current challenges related to improving the quality of human capital management in the context of sustainable development. Their implementation contributes to improving the strategic management of universities, developing the research capacity of academic staff, and enhancing the competitiveness of the higher education system.
10.	Quality of writing and design	Quality of academic writing: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low	The dissertation is written in a clear, consistent, and academically appropriate language, demonstrating a high level of proficiency in scientific writing and argumentation. The text is characterized by logical coherence, internal consistency, and a systematic presentation of the material, while the conceptual framework is used correctly and consistently throughout the dissertation. The theoretical provisions, results of the empirical research, and practical recommendations are presented consistently and in an interconnected manner, ensuring the overall coherence of the study. The structure of the dissertation corresponds to the logic of the research, while the tables, figures, and diagrams effectively complement the presentation of the main results. The formatting of the dissertation complies with academic requirements, and the references and bibliography are presented correctly. Overall, the quality of academic writing should be assessed as high.
11.	Comments on the dissertation	There are some minor editorial comments concerning the style of presentation, which do not affect the overall positive assessment of the dissertation.	
12.	The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the research topic (in the case of defending a dissertation in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each article of the doctoral student on the research topic)	The scientific level of the PhD candidate's publications can be assessed as high. The publications consistently reflect the main stages of the research and contain the key scientific results presented in the dissertation. The research results have been published in international peer-reviewed journals indexed in the Scopus database, as well as in scientific publications recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which demonstrates their compliance with contemporary requirements for the quality of scientific research and their successful completion of independent scientific peer review. The topics of the publications fully correspond to the aim, objectives, and content of the dissertation, and the main scientific provisions have undergone the necessary scientific validation. The presented works confirm the independent nature of the conducted research, the scientific validity of the obtained results, and their contribution to the development of research in the field of human capital management in the higher education system in the context of the "green" transition.	
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the Standard Provisions)	To award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – "Management".	

The dissertation of Gulbakhyt Serikovna Olzhebayeva entitled “Mechanisms of human capital capacity management of higher education system of Kazakhstan in the context of green transition” meets the requirements for dissertations submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD). The PhD candidate deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational programme “8D04101 – Management.”

Official reviewer,
PhD, associate professor of Kazakh-British Technical University

Амірбекова Д.К.



Подпись Амірбекова Д.К. заверяю
Департамент
по развитию персонала