

REVIEW
of the official reviewer of the dissertation of
Sabdenaliev Bakhitvar Assylbavuly on the topic «Modernisation of the Quality Management System in Higher Education Institutions in Kazakhstan through Digitalisation of Processes», for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
on the educational program 8D04102 – «Management»

№ No.	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs: <u>1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or targeted program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</u> 2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);	<p>The dissertation corresponds to the main priorities of state policy and the strategic documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The subject matter of the research is directly related to the objectives set out in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Address by the Head of State, K.-J. Tokayev, dated 8 September 2025, «Kazakhstan in the Age of Artificial Intelligence: Current Challenges and Their Solutions through Digital Transformation», which emphasises the need for digital modernisation of the economy, the integration of science and innovation management, and increasing the return on state investment in the scientific sector; - The Development Strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2050, aimed at creating a competitive knowledge-based economy in which higher education plays a systemic role; - The Concept for the Development of Higher Education and Science in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023–2029, which provides for the improvement of mechanisms to ensure and enhance the quality of educational processes; - The Concept for Digital Transformation, Development of the Information and Communication Technologies Sector and Cybersecurity for 2023–2029, aimed at introducing digital technologies into key sectors of the economy, including the education sector. <p>Furthermore, this dissertation was completed as part of the PTF project BR24992974 «Modernisation of the higher education quality assurance system in Kazakhstan based</p>

	<p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)</p>	<p>on digitalisation: development of approaches, mechanisms and an information base» (2024–2026), funded from the state budget of the of the Science Committee of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.</p>
<p>2.</p> <p>Importance for science</p>	<p>The work <u>does</u>/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance <u>is well-disclosed</u>/not disclosed.</p>	<p>The dissertation constitutes a scientifically sound study containing results that are significant for the development of the theoretical and methodological foundations of quality management in higher education in the context of digitalisation. The doctoral candidate has proposed a new approach to the transformation of existing models for assessing the quality of education through the prism of meta-competencies and the digital adaptability of the education system. The research has developed scientifically grounded recommendations aimed at modernising the quality management system for higher education in Kazakhstani universities through the digitalisation of processes, which aligns with the priority areas of the state's education policy and contemporary global trends. Thus, the dissertation is distinguished by its relevance and depth of research, contributes to the development of approaches to quality management in higher education, and can be utilised in the development of digital transformation strategies for universities, as well as in the improvement of state policy in the field of higher education.</p>
<p>3.</p> <p>Principle of autonomy</p>	<p>Level of autonomy:</p> <p><u>1) high;</u> 2) medium; 3) low; 4) no independence.</p>	<p>The dissertation demonstrates a high level of independence on the part of the doctoral candidate. The doctoral candidate has identified a topical scientific and practical problem related to the modernisation of the higher education quality management system in the context of digitalisation, justified the choice of theoretical and methodological approaches, and conducted a comprehensive analysis that ensured the reliability of the results obtained. The methodological framework of the dissertation research combines quantitative and conceptual methods aimed at analysing the mechanisms of digitalisation in the quality management of education at higher education institutions in Kazakhstan. The empirical part is based on a dataset on the activity of academic staff, covering classified types of work, their duration, distribution across time periods and types of digital engagement. The doctoral candidate's use of modern analytical software (Python, JASP), as well as the development of a quality management platform model, demonstrate well-developed</p>

		<p>skills in independent research and the ability to integrate theoretical principles with practical tools. The research findings are of scientific and practical significance and can be utilised in improving quality management systems in higher education institutions and in developing strategies for the digital transformation of higher education.</p>
<p>4. Principle of internal unity</p>	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:</p> <p>1) Justified; 2) partially justified; 3) not substantiated.</p>	<p>This dissertation addresses one of the pressing issues in the modernisation of the higher education quality management system, driven by the need to enhance the efficiency of management processes, ensure transparency in the assessment of educational outcomes, and adapt universities to the demands of the digital economy. The dissertation examines how the digitalisation of processes influences the transformation of education quality management mechanisms, including the implementation of analytical tools, digital platforms and monitoring systems that enable data-driven management decisions. The doctoral candidate justifies the need to move from the piecemeal use of digital solutions to the formation of a holistic quality management system, encompassing the levels of data collection, processing and interpretation. The work proposes mechanisms for the digitalisation of the quality management system and develops a model of a platform-based solution aimed at enhancing the transparency, manageability and sustainability of educational processes. Thus, the doctoral research not only reveals the essence and directions of the digital modernisation of quality management, but also forms a practice-oriented basis for the implementation of relevant solutions in the activities of higher education institutions in Kazakhstan.</p>
	<p>4.2: The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic:</p> <p>1) correspond to; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond.</p>	<p>The content of the dissertation corresponds to the stated research topic and systematically addresses the main issues. The doctoral candidate systematically examines the theoretical and methodological aspects of the problem of modernising the quality management system in higher education in the context of digitalisation. The structure of the dissertation is logical and reflects the internal interconnection of all sections with the key research issues: from the analysis of theoretical and methodological foundations and the syndissertation of international experience to the assessment of the current state of the quality management system in higher education institutions in Kazakhstan, as well as the development of scientifically grounded recommendations and models for digital transformation. The doctoral candidate systematically examines the stated aims and objectives of the research, employs the appropriate methodology, and the results obtained are directly linked to the formulation of the topic and aimed at resolving the identified scientific problem. Thus, the content of the dissertation fully corresponds to its topic, is characterised by logical</p>

	<p>4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) correspond to;</p> <p>2) partially correspond;</p> <p>3) do not correspond.</p>	<p>coherence and consistency of presentation, and ensures the scientific completeness of the research.</p> <p>The aim of the dissertation research is correctly formulated, reflects the essence of the stated topic and is directed towards solving a topical scientific problem related to the modernisation of the higher education quality management system in the context of digitalisation. The objectives set logically follow from the aim of the research, are structured sequentially and cover all key aspects of the issue under consideration. It is important to note that each of the objectives set corresponds directly to the relevant chapters and sections of the dissertation, which confirms the logical coherence of the work. Each chapter of the dissertation reflects a separate stage in the implementation of the research objectives, and the aggregate of the results obtained ensures the achievement of the overall aim of the work. Thus, the interconnection between the aim, objectives and structure of the dissertation is evident at all stages of the research, which attests to the internal coherence and scientific completeness of the work.</p>
<p>4.4 All sections and statements of the dissertation are logically interrelated:</p> <p>1) fully interrelated;</p> <p>2) partially interrelated;</p> <p>3) do not interrelated.</p>	<p>The sections and propositions of the dissertation are structured sequentially and are logically consistent with one another. Theoretical propositions are developed in the analytical section, and the results of the analysis serve as the basis for formulating well-founded conclusions and practical recommendations. The propositions put forward for defence are directly based on the results of the analysis and correspond to the stated aims and objectives. Overall, the dissertation demonstrates a high level of logical organisation of the material and the completeness of the scientific research.</p>	
<p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are substantiated and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:</p> <p>1) there is critical analysis</p> <p>2) the analysis is partial;</p> <p>3) the analysis does not represent personal opinions, but rather quotes from other authors;</p> <p>4) no analysis.</p>	<p>The dissertation presents a critical analysis of existing approaches to quality management in higher education, including classical models (TQM, PDCA), as well as modern digital tools and concepts of digital maturity in universities. The PhD candidate does not limit themselves to describing known solutions but identifies their limitations and specific features of application within the context of the national higher education system. The solutions proposed in the dissertation, including a model for the digital modernisation of the quality management system and a platform-based approach, are substantiated based on a comparative analysis of international experience and adapted to the conditions in Kazakhstan. In particular, the dissertation proposes a multi-level model for the implementation of digital solutions, comprising the stages of diagnosis, piloting and institutionalisation of quality mechanisms. Furthermore, the provisions developed provide a basis for the creation of digital quality management platforms, including iPortal, which is geared towards the automation of monitoring, the visualisation of educational data and the formation of</p>	

		<p>adaptive feedback mechanisms. Thus, the dissertation demonstrates a critical analysis, which attests to the doctoral candidate's high level of academic competence.</p>
<p>5. Principle of scientific novelty</p>	<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The scientific results of the dissertation are characterised by a high degree of scientific novelty, manifested in the development and justification of approaches to the digital modernisation of the higher education quality management system, as well as in the adaptation of existing theoretical and methodological propositions to the conditions of Kazakhstan. Novelty is evident both in the formulation of the problem and in the development of management mechanisms. Firstly, the dissertation develops and theoretically substantiates a conceptual model of the digital transformation of the higher education quality management system, based on the integration of systemic, process-based and institutional approaches. Secondly, a methodology for analysing the digitalisation of quality management processes is proposed, involving the application of statistical analysis, factor and cluster analysis, as well as tools for visualising and interpreting digital indicators, which has enabled the identification of patterns in digital activity and the assessment of the level of digital maturity of the educational environment. Thirdly, the doctoral candidate has proposed directions for the digital transformation of the university quality assurance system, including the creation of a unified data architecture, the development of staff digital competencies, and the standardisation of analytical tools at the level of educational programmes. Fourthly, a roadmap for the digital modernisation of the higher education quality management system has been developed and justified. Fifthly, a model of the iPortal digital platform is proposed, aimed at enhancing institutional sustainability, transparency and the manageability of educational quality assurance processes. Thus, the body of presented provisions is characterised by methodological novelty and contributes to the development of approaches to higher education quality management in the context of digital transformation.</p>
	<p>5.2 Are conclusions of the dissertation new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p>	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation research as a whole possess elements of scientific novelty and logically follow from the analysis conducted. Overall, the results are formulated coherently, substantiated by the findings, and reflect the author's position on key issues concerning the digital modernisation of the quality management system in higher education. The novelty of the conclusions is evident in the generalisation and interpretation of the research results, as well as in the formulation of practice-oriented</p>

	<p>3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>recommendations. It is significant that the conclusions are based on the models and methodological solutions proposed by the author, including the concept of digital transformation of the quality management system and the development of platform-based tools. At the same time, certain provisions of the conclusions are based on the development and adaptation of well-known theoretical approaches and methodological concepts (systemic, process-based and digital management) to the conditions of the national education system, which is consistent with the applied nature of the research and does not diminish their scientific significance. Thus, the conclusions of the dissertation contain a significant proportion of new elements, possess theoretical and practical value, but on the whole can be classified as partially new.</p>
	<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and justified:</p> <p>1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>This dissertation presents managerial and technological solutions possessing a high degree of scientific novelty. The approaches to the digital modernisation of the quality management system in higher education proposed by the doctoral candidate are based on the integration of modern analytical tools, digital platforms and methodological principles of data-driven management. Fundamentally new solutions include the development of a conceptual model for the digital transformation of the quality management system, the formation of a data-driven management architecture, and the creation of a digital platform model that automates the processes of monitoring, analysis and management decision-making. These solutions are characterised by a systematic approach, are adapted to the operating conditions of higher education institutions in Kazakhstan, and are geared towards improving the efficiency, transparency and manageability of educational processes. The validity of the proposed solutions is confirmed by the results of the analysis conducted, the use of modern methodological tools, and their alignment with current trends in the development of higher education and the digital economy. Thus, the managerial and technological solutions presented in the dissertation are novel, theoretically sound and practically applicable.</p>
<p>6. Validity of the main conclusions</p>	<p>All key findings are based/not based on sound scientific evidence or are reasonably well substantiated (for qualitative research and arts and humanities majors).</p>	<p>The validity of the main conclusions of the doctoral research is ensured using modern methodological tools, including methods of quantitative analysis and digital analytics. The study utilises Python and JASP software, as well as a range of statistical methods, such as correlation analysis, factor analysis, clustering and data normalisation, which ensures the reliability of the identified patterns and their statistical significance. The application of transition matrices and elements of Markov process logic has enabled the analysis of stable trajectories of digital behaviour, thereby enhancing the analytical depth of the study. Furthermore, the validity of the results is confirmed using data</p>

		<p>visualisation and interpretation tools. Thus, the main conclusions of the dissertation follow logically from the analysis conducted, are methodologically sound and supported by empirical data, which attests to their scientific validity.</p>
<p>7. The main provisions submitted for defense</p>	<p>The following questions must be answered for each position separately:</p> <p>7.1 Has the position been proven?</p> <p>1) proven:</p> <p>2) most likely proven; 3) most likely not proven; 4) not proven; 5) in its current formulation, it is impossible to verify the provenness of the proposition.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) yes; 2) no:</p> <p>3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) yes: 2) no; 3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application:</p>	<p>Proposition 1.</p> <p>The dissertation justifies the feasibility of applying foreign quality management models in the Kazakhstani context based on a comparative analysis of international practices in education quality management. The PhD candidate compares foreign models with the operating conditions of Kazakhstan's higher education system, which has made it possible to provide a well-reasoned justification for their applicability, taking into account national specificities. The validity of this proposition is ensured by the logical sequence of arguments, the use of scientifically sound approaches, and the identification of factors limiting the direct adoption of foreign practices. The conclusions presented are supported by the results of the analysis, which allows this proposition to be recognised as proven.</p> <p>Proposition 2.</p> <p>The doctoral candidate has developed a methodological toolkit for analysing the digital transformation of quality management in educational activities, based on the use of modern methods of statistical and multidimensional analysis. The dissertation justifies the appropriateness of applying this toolkit to assess digital activity and the level of development of quality management systems in higher education institutions in Kazakhstan. The validity of this proposition is ensured using correlation, factor and cluster analysis methods, as well as the application of modern data processing software. The conclusions presented are supported by analytical results, which allows this proposition to be recognised as proven.</p> <p>Proposition 3.</p> <p>The dissertation proposes the main directions for the digital transformation of the higher education quality management system, including the formation of a unified data architecture, the development of staff digital competencies, and the standardisation of analytical tools at the level of educational programmes. The validity of the proposition is ensured by the logical sequence of the analysis, the use of modern approaches to</p>

		<p>1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide; 4) in its current wording, it is impossible to verify the level of application of the provision.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes; 2) no; 3) In the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.</p>	<p>quality management and digital transformation, as well as the justification of the proposed directions, taking into account the national specifics of the higher education system.</p> <p>Proposition 4.</p> <p>The doctoral candidate has developed and substantiated a roadmap for the digital modernisation of the higher education quality management system, including implementation stages, key monitoring indicators and potential institutional risks. This proposition is based on a syndissertation of the results of theoretical and empirical analysis, as well as taking into account contemporary requirements for the digital transformation of education systems. The proposed roadmap is systematic in nature, reflects the phased implementation of digital solutions and takes into account the specific features of how higher education institutions in Kazakhstan operate. Overall, the proposed roadmap is based on the results of the analysis conducted and takes into account the actual operating conditions of higher education institutions in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>Proposition 5.</p> <p>The doctoral candidate proposed a model of the iPortal digital platform, aimed at enhancing the transparency, manageability and sustainability of the education quality assurance system. The model provides for the use of digital tools for data collection, processing and analysis, which enables improved management decision-making in higher education institutions. The platform is designed to simplify monitoring and enhance the effectiveness of quality management.</p>
8.	Principle of reliability.	<p>8.1 The choice of methodology – is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail: 1) yes; 2) no.</p>	<p>The choice of methodology in the dissertation research is justified and corresponds to the stated aims and objectives. The study utilises tools such as correlation analysis, factor and cluster analysis, Z-normalisation, as well as elements of transient state analysis. Python and JASP software were used for data processing, ensuring the accuracy and reproducibility of the results. The sources of information used are reliable and representative, including scientific publications by domestic and foreign authors, as well as empirical data obtained during the research. Thus, the research methodology and the information base used are reliable and sufficient to achieve the set objectives.</p>
	Reliability of sources and information provided	<p>8.2 The results of the dissertation were obtained using modern scientific research methods and data processing and interpretation</p>	<p>The results of the dissertation research were obtained using modern scientific methods of data analysis and processing. The study employed modern data processing methods, including correlation analysis (Pearson, Spearman), factor analysis (Principal Axis Factoring), cluster analysis (Ward's method), Z-normalisation, as well as elements of transition state analysis (Markov transition-like logic), which enabled the</p>

<p>techniques using computer technologies:</p>	<p>1) yes; 2) no.</p>	<p>identification of latent structures, stable behavioural trajectories and patterns of digital activity. Data processing and interpretation were carried out using modern computer technologies and software tools, including Python (pandas, numpy, matplotlib, seaborn, scipy, scikit-learn, plotly, graphviz, networkx) and JASP, ensuring the accuracy of calculations, visualisation of results and reproducibility of the analysis. Thus, the results of the dissertation were obtained using modern research methods and data processing technologies, which confirms their scientific validity, reliability and compliance with contemporary requirements for scientific research.</p>
<p>8.3 The theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):</p>	<p>1) yes; 2) no.</p>	<p>The theoretical conclusions and models proposed in the dissertation are substantiated by the results of the empirical study and confirmed on the basis of the data collected. The study utilised a dataset on the digital activity of academic staff, which enabled the identification of patterns, interrelationships and typical behavioural models within the higher education quality management system. The application of modern methods of quantitative analysis, including correlation, factor and cluster analysis, as well as the use of elements of transient state analysis, enabled the identification of stable interrelationships and the confirmation of the proposed propositions. The results obtained served as the basis for the development and verification of the proposed models, including a model of the digital transformation of the quality management system and a platform solution. Thus, the theoretical propositions, identified patterns and developed models are confirmed by the results of the analysis, which attests to their validity and reliability.</p>
<p>8.4 Important claims are supported/partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.</p>		<p>The dissertation is characterised by a high level of theoretical rigour and the soundness of its conclusions. Most of the key propositions are supported by references to contemporary and authoritative sources reflecting current approaches to quality management in higher education and digital transformation. All main conclusions are based on the processing of collected data, the application of modern methods of quantitative analysis and their interpretation. The dissertation employs a range of methods of quantitative analysis and data processing, which further strengthens the research's evidence base. Thus, the key assertions formulated in the dissertation are well-founded and supported by the research findings.</p>
<p>8.5 The literature sources used are sufficient/not sufficient for a literature review.</p>		<p>The academic literature used in the doctoral research is sufficient in terms of volume and content and corresponds to the subject matter of the work. The doctoral candidate demonstrates a good knowledge of contemporary theoretical and methodological approaches to the study of quality management in higher education in the context of digitalisation, drawing on both classical and contemporary research by domestic and foreign authors. The dissertation systematises the main strands of scientific analysis of</p>

		<p>quality management — the systemic, process-based, institutional and digital approaches. A detailed analysis is presented of the works of authors such as W.E. Deming, J.M. Juran, P.B. Crosby, K. Ishikawa, A.V. Feigenbaum, G. Taguchi, as well as L. Harvey, D. Green, J. Biggs, J. Brennan, P. Scott, H. Harms, U. Teichler, D.F. Westerheijden, M. Kofler, M. Benson, D. Houston, J. Tilly, S. Stauffer, O. Kivinen, R. Schroeder and others. The author systematically outlines the key characteristics of modern quality management systems, including their relationship with academic autonomy, the institutional environment and digital transformations. The PhD candidate pays particular attention to the analysis of the application of TQM principles and the process approach, including the works of H. Kanya, C. Lauri, B. Bergman, L. Klebeck, W. Mussel, A. Scharrel, as well as research in the field of the digitalisation of education. In the dissertation, the doctoral candidate systematically examines the specifics of implementing BI systems, LMS platforms, analytics tools and digital maturity models, as well as their impact on the development of educational organisations. Particular emphasis is placed on the existence of a research gap related to the insufficient development of comprehensive models for the digital modernisation of quality management systems in the context of Kazakhstan. Thus, the literature sources used are sufficient, relevant and representative for the exploration of the dissertation research topic.</p>
<p>9. Principle of practical value</p>	<p>9.1 The dissertation has theoretical significance: 1) yes; 2) no.</p> <p>9.2 The dissertation has practical significance and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice:</p>	<p>The dissertation has theoretical significance, as it refines scientific approaches to quality management in higher education in the context of digitalisation. The doctoral candidate proposes a conceptual model of the digital transformation of the quality management system, based on the integration of systemic, process-based and institutional approaches, which expands existing theoretical understanding in this field. The dissertation establishes a methodological framework for analysing the digital modernisation of educational processes, including the structuring of quality management according to the levels of data collection, processing and utilisation. The results obtained contribute to the deepening of the theory of educational quality management, reveal the interconnection between digital mechanisms and the effectiveness of management decisions, and may serve as a basis for further scientific research in the field of educational management.</p> <p>The dissertation has significant practical relevance, as it contains specific recommendations and tools aimed at modernising the higher education quality management system in the context of digitalisation. The solutions developed by the author, including the digital transformation roadmap, methodological analysis tools and the iPortal digital platform model, are geared towards practical application in the</p>

	<p>1) yes; 2) no.</p>	<p>activities of higher education institutions. The practical significance of the results is also confirmed by the existence of implementation reports, which demonstrate the possibility of their use in the actual operations of educational organisations. Furthermore, the dissertation was completed as part of the PTF project BR24992974 «Modernisation of the higher education quality assurance system in Kazakhstan based on digitalisation: development of approaches, mechanisms and an information base» (2024–2026). Thus, the research findings are of an applied nature and have high potential for practical application.</p>
	<p>9.3 Are the practice offering new: 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The dissertation presents new practice-oriented solutions in the field of digital modernisation of the quality management system in higher education. The tools developed by the doctoral candidate, including the iPortal digital platform model, the transformation roadmap and methodological approaches to the analysis of digital processes, have no direct equivalents in the practice of domestic universities and are adapted to the specifics of the national education system. The proposed solutions are comprehensive in nature, focused on the integration of digital technologies into management processes, and aimed at enhancing the efficiency, transparency and sustainability of the education quality assurance system. Practical applicability and novelty are confirmed by the existence of implementation documents, as well as the implementation of the results within the framework of the PTF research project BR24992974, which attests to the relevance and innovative nature of the proposed solutions.</p>
<p>10. Quality of writing and design</p>	<p>Quality of academic writing: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.</p>	<p>Sabdenaliyev B.A. demonstrates a confident command of academic style, clearly articulates concepts and correctly uses terminology in the field of quality management and the digital transformation of higher education. The phrasing is precise and substantive, ensuring clarity and logical presentation of the material. The text is well-structured, with logical transitions between sections and no significant stylistic or terminological inconsistencies. The use of sources is correct, references are formatted in accordance with academic requirements, and the language of the work meets the standards of academic research in the field of «Management». Thus, the quality of academic writing is assessed as high, and the style of presentation meets the requirements for dissertations of this level.</p>
<p>11. Comments on the dissertation</p>	<p>The comments are of a specific nature and relate to individual phrasing and stylistic aspects, without affecting the content or the academic component of the dissertation. Overall, the presentation of the material is maintained in an academic style, characterised by clarity, logic and consistency. At the same time, certain conclusions are based on the development and adaptation of well-known theoretical approaches and methodological concepts (systemic, process-based and digital management) to the conditions of the national education system, which is consistent with the applied</p>	

	nature of the research and does not diminish its scientific significance. Overall, the standard of the dissertation meets the established requirements for research submitted for a PhD in the discipline of «Management».
12. The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the research topic (in the case of defending a dissertation in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers' comment on the scientific level of each article of the doctoral student on the research topic)	The academic standard of the doctoral candidate's publications on the topic of the dissertation research can be assessed as high. The main provisions and results of the work have been tested in five scientific publications, including two articles published in journals indexed in the Scopus database above the 0.25th percentile, and two articles published in CQASHE journals. The subject matter of the publications fully corresponds to the content of the dissertation research. The publications presented confirm the validation of the main provisions and conclusions of the dissertation within the scientific community.
13. Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the Standard Provisions)	Awarding of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04102 – «Management»

The dissertation work of Sabdenaliyev Bakhitiyar Assylbayuly entitled «Modernisation of the Quality Management System in Higher Education Institutions in Kazakhstan through Digitalisation of Processes», meets the requirements for a doctoral dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author is worthy of being awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) under the educational programme 8D04102 – «Management».

Official Reviewer

Professor, Doctor of Economics



Spankulova L.S.

КОЛТАНБАСЫН
РАСТАЙМЫН
ПОДПИСЬ ЗАВЕРЯЮ