

REVIEW

of the official reviewer on the dissertation work of

Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms», for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
on the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics»

№ No.	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs:</p> <p><u>1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</u></p> <p>2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);</p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)</p>	<p>The dissertation was completed within the framework of the priority area of scientific development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan—Research in the field of social sciences and humanities. The dissertation was prepared as part of a completed grant project funded by the state budget, AP09260584 “Restructuring of employment of Kazakhstan in conditions of socio-economic tension” (2021–2023), as well as within the framework of the current grant project AP23488981 “Transformation of Kazakhstan's labor resources against the background of technological challenges: new quality, model, scenarios” (2024–2026), in which the applicant is the executor and an active member of the research group. The topic of the dissertation research is extremely relevant for modern Kazakhstan. It aims to understand and address the most important challenges associated with the transformation of human resources and ensuring sustainable employment of the young population in a rapidly changing socio-economic environment and technological transformations. Taking into account the priority tasks outlined in the Address of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Kassym-Jomart Tokayev “Just Kazakhstan: Law and Order, Economic Growth, Social Optimism” dated September 2, 2024, as well as in the National Development Plan of the Republic</p>

			<p>of Kazakhstan until 2029, the applicant's research is timely and meets state requirements. The choice of topic reflects a deep understanding of the current strategic directions of the country's socio-economic policy. The work makes a significant contribution to the scientific justification of mechanisms for the adaptation and development of labor potential, which is important for the implementation of national programs aimed at improving employment efficiency, developing human capital, and strengthening the social stability of regions. Thus, the topic and results of the dissertation research are of considerable interest to both the scientific community and government agencies involved in the formation and implementation of Kazakhstan's socio-economic policy.</p>
2.	Importance for science	<p>The work <u>does</u>/does not make a significant contribution to science and its importance <u>is well-disclosed</u>/not disclosed</p>	<p>The dissertation research makes a significant contribution to science, and its importance is clearly demonstrated by the relevance of the issues under consideration: 1) the author's vision of the economic essence of the concept of "effective youth employment" in the context of new global challenges is presented, reflecting the contemporary content of this phenomenon in the context of labor market transformation. This study broadens theoretical understanding of youth employment, taking into account the changing conditions of the global economy; 2) a concept for ensuring employment in the modern economy is formulated, taking into account structural changes in the field of employment. New theoretical and methodological approaches have been introduced that will help in the further development of research in the field of economic transformation and employment; 3) priorities and mechanisms for ensuring youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the context of global challenges, including digitalization, economic instability, and changes in the educational environment, have been identified. These conclusions are of practical importance for the development of state policy in the field of youth employment and social security; 4) A model for</p>

			<p>assessing employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector has been developed, taking into account the influence of corporate identity factors, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels (WOM) on youth motivation to find and stay in employment. The results of the work open up new avenues for research in the field of labor relations and HR management; 5) a “Career Constructor” has been proposed as the main tool for the professional development of graduates of secondary specialized and higher education institutions. This innovative solution is an important contribution to the development of career counseling and educational practices, which will help improve the quality of training and adapt it to the needs of the labor market. Thus, the results of the dissertation research represent a significant contribution to the development of science and practice in the field of labor relations, youth employment, and vocational education, as well as to the formation of effective social policy and economic transformation strategies in Kazakhstan.</p>
3.	Principle of autonomy	Level of autonomy:	<p>The dissertation research demonstrates the candidate's high level of independence, which is confirmed by a full cycle of scientific publications on the research topic. These works, published in journals indexed in bibliometric databases such as Scopus and the National Citation Database of Kazakhstan, confirm the candidate's deep understanding of the research problem and ability to independently analyze and synthesize existing theories and data. The structure of the dissertation clearly reflects the stages of scientific research, confirming the applicant's ability not only to plan independently, but also to conduct scientific work at all stages. The candidate has conducted a thorough and critical review of the scientific literature, identified existing gaps and limitations in research, and proposed original approaches and solutions to address these gaps. This approach demonstrates not only the theoretical depth but also the practical significance of the work. Thus, the candidate's level of independence and scientific maturity</p>
		<p><u>1)high;</u> 2) medium; 3) low; 4)no independence.</p>	

			is highly valued, making the dissertation a valuable contribution to the development of scientific research in the field of employment and social policy.
4.	Principle of internal unity	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:</p> <p>1) <u>justified</u>; 2) partially justified; 3) not substantiated.</p>	<p>The relevance of the dissertation research is undoubtedly confirmed and thoroughly substantiated. The candidate has successfully identified the most important problems related to youth employment both at the global level and in the context of Kazakhstan. The work focuses on the need to develop effective mechanisms and tools to promote youth employment, which emphasizes both the theoretical significance and practical applicability of the research in real-life conditions. In the context of current global transformations, when youth employment issues are becoming increasingly relevant, in-depth theoretical and methodological developments are necessary. The applicant rightly raises the issue of the need for a comprehensive scientific analysis of the processes of professional self-realization of the younger generation, as well as the development of effective state instruments aimed at adapting the education system to the needs of the labor market. It is particularly noteworthy that the study of international experience in the field of youth employment, taking into account the socio-economic characteristics of different countries, provides valuable information and allows us to identify a number of successful practices that can be adapted to the conditions of Kazakhstan. A comparative analysis of these examples clearly demonstrates the need to adapt them to national characteristics and strategic guidelines for the country's sustainable development. Thus, the chosen research topic is not only relevant but also strategically important for the further development of effective state mechanisms in the field of youth employment. The applicant has successfully completed the assigned tasks, and his work represents valuable scientific research with high practical potential.</p>

		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic:	<p>The content of the dissertation fully corresponds to the chosen topic. The main part of the work logically and consistently reveals the key aspects of the chosen topic. The titles of the structural subdivisions of the chapters are formulated correctly, reflect the internal logic of the presentation, and do not go beyond the scope defined by the topic of each chapter. The theoretical analysis and empirical research conducted are fully consistent with the stated topic of the dissertation, ensuring its scientific integrity and validity. The recommendations presented in the dissertation are also relevant and well-founded, they correspond to modern challenges and offer specific measures to solve problems, which emphasizes the practical significance of the work.</p>
		<p>1) <u>reflects;</u> 2) partially reflects; 3) does not reflect.</p>	
		4.3. The purpose and objectives are consistent with the thesis topic:	
		<p>1) <u>correspond to;</u> 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond.</p>	<p>The aim and objectives of the study are fully consistent with the topic of the dissertation and thoroughly explore all key aspects of the chosen topic. The aim of the study is to develop theoretical and methodological approaches for selecting key priorities and improving mechanisms for regulating youth employment in Kazakhstan in the context of contemporary global challenges, which is a timely and important task. The research objectives, formulated on the basis of this goal, cover a wide range of issues: from theoretical analysis of current trends in the labor market to the development of specific proposals for improving state policy in the field of youth employment. This consistent development of issues throughout the work has enabled the candidate to achieve key results and offer scientifically sound recommendations that can be applied in practice. The emphasis on a comprehensive approach to solving the research problems underscores the scientific relevance of the chosen topic and its significance for the further development of the country's social and economic policy.</p>
		4.4 All sections and statements of the thesis are logically interrelated:	<p>The content of the dissertation is logically structured, fully coherent, and demonstrates internal consistency. The work carried</p>

		<p>1) fully interrelated;</p> <p>2) partially interrelated;</p> <p>3) there is no interrelation.</p>	<p>out in the dissertation is based on logically related theoretical and practical provisions, which allowed the candidate to achieve internal consistency in their conclusions. The dissertation has a clear logical structure, which serves as the basis for the consistent disclosure of key provisions in the context of the stated goal and objectives. The logic of the work is based on a step-by-step transition from a general scientific review of youth employment theories and company attractiveness theories to the author's approach to formulating a conceptual model of employment and a theoretical model of company attractiveness, as well as the development of effective and practical recommendations for ensuring youth employment in the country.</p>
		<p>4.5 New solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:</p>	<p>The candidate conducted an in-depth critical analysis of existing research on youth employment in the context of global challenges, taking into account both international experience and the specific characteristics of the labor market in Kazakhstan. Attention is paid to various theories and models of youth employment, their strengths and weaknesses, as well as an analysis of their applicability in Kazakhstan. Particular attention is paid to assessing the effectiveness of government education programs aimed at supporting youth employment and the role of employers as key factors influencing youth employment. The candidate also critically examines alternative approaches to solving the problem of youth employment, proposing new, more effective mechanisms for achieving the set goals. All conclusions in the work are supported by logical arguments, demonstrating a high level of critical thinking and in-depth scientific study of the topic.</p>
		<p>1) there is critical analysis;</p> <p>2) the analysis is partial;</p> <p>3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors;</p> <p>4) no analysis.</p>	
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?</p>	<p>The scientific results and conclusions presented in the dissertation are entirely new and make a significant contribution to the development of theory and practice in the field of youth employment in the context of a changing labor market and contemporary economic challenges. The candidate offers a new interpretation of the economic nature of "effective youth</p>
		<p>1) completely new;</p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	

			<p>employment” in the context of global challenges, taking into account contemporary transformations in the labor market. The thesis develops a new concept of employment support that takes into account structural shifts in the labor market and identifies key priorities and mechanisms for ensuring youth employment in Kazakhstan, considering factors such as digitalization, economic instability, and changes in the education system. The applicant has proposed a model for assessing the attractiveness of employers in the HTTL sector, taking into account corporate culture, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels that influence youth motivation and retention in the organization. In addition, a “Career Builder” has been developed as a tool for developing new skills and improving the qualifications of graduates of vocational and higher education institutions.</p>
		<p>5.2 The conclusions of the thesis are new?</p> <p><u>1) completely new;</u> 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation concerning youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the context of contemporary global challenges are entirely new and logically consistent with the thesis of the work. The research results are based on in-depth scientific analysis, extensive empirical data, and sound methodological approaches. These conclusions not only offer a new perspective on youth employment, but also introduce innovative mechanisms and models aimed at addressing contemporary challenges such as digitalization, economic instability, and changing educational requirements. The recommendations of the study constitute a valuable contribution to the development of policies aimed at improving youth employment prospects in Kazakhstan, underscoring the relevance and practical significance of the research.</p>
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and reasonable:</p>	<p>The economic solutions proposed in the dissertation are completely new in the context of developing mechanisms and recommendations for ensuring youth employment in Kazakhstan</p>

		<p>1) <u>completely new</u>;</p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>in the face of modern global challenges. The applicable technical, technological, economic, and managerial solutions represent innovative approaches that are in harmony with current labor market trends and respond to the challenges arising from globalization and the digitalization of the economy. The applicant has proposed new methods aimed at improving and optimizing existing youth employment programs, including strategies for introducing digital technologies and increasing the effectiveness of government initiatives. The economic solutions proposed in the thesis are well thought out and aimed at strengthening financial stability, improving working conditions, and creating new jobs for young people. All proposed solutions are logically justified and aimed at long-term stabilization of youth employment, which is important for the sustainable development of the country in the context of global economic uncertainty. They not only meet the needs of the modern economy, but also serve as a basis for the formation of effective state policy in the field of youth employment.</p>
6.	The validity of the main conclusions	<p>All major conclusions <u>are</u>/are not based on scientifically rigorous evidence or are reasonably well supported (for qualitative research and arts and humanities training areas).</p>	<p>The main conclusions of the dissertation are thoroughly substantiated and supported by empirical data that correspond to the analytical methods used in the study. The validity and reasoning behind each scientific result obtained by the researcher, as well as their reliability and quality, are determined by the content of the work presented. When writing the dissertation, the candidate made extensive use of empirical data and drew on the work of numerous scholars who have conducted research on related topics, which made it possible to obtain scientifically and practically significant results. In addition, by analyzing domestic and foreign studies on youth employment issues, the researcher was able to substantiate and confirm the individual scientific results obtained. To collect additional information, materials from scientific publications and relevant data from recent periodicals, including government programs and presidential messages, were</p>

			<p>used. The study also used official data from the latest statistical compilations of the National Statistics Bureau of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Particular attention was paid to surveys conducted using the Webropol program, which are aimed at collecting information about the attractiveness of employers for young people. The surveys allowed for an in-depth analysis of the factors influencing young people's choice of work and their retention in companies. These data formed the basis for the development of an employer attractiveness model for the Kazakhstani labor market. The use of Webropol provided important empirical evidence that increased the accuracy and practical value of conclusions related to youth employment in the context of new global challenges. The extensive use of data, the applicant's participation in grant projects, and comprehensive scientific analysis made it possible to obtain reliable and well-founded results, confirming the scientific validity of the dissertation.</p>
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	The following questions need to be answered for each provision individually:	<p>1. The author's conceptualization of the economic essence of "effective youth employment" in the context of global change. 7.1 Proven: Yes, the applicant substantiates the concept based on an in-depth analysis of scientific literature and a synthesis of classical and modern theories of employment. 7.2 Non-trivial: No, the proposed definition goes beyond standard interpretations and includes aspects of employment quality, social protection, and career opportunities. 7.3 Novelty: Yes, the concept is original and corresponds to the specific socio-economic realities of Kazakhstan. 7.4 Level of application: Broad, the concept can be integrated into the development of employment strategies and programs aimed at developing human capital, increasing economic activity, and improving the sustainability of young people in the labor market in the face of global challenges. 7.5 Proven in the article: Yes, the concept was developed and substantiated in scientific articles presented in the dissertation.</p>
		7.1 Is the provision proven?	
		1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven. 5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.2 Is it trivial?	
		1) yes; 2) no;	
		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	

		7.3 Is it new?	<p>2.The conceptual model of ensuring youth employment in the modern economy, taking into account structural changes in the field of employment.</p> <p>7.1 Proven: Yes, the trends are proven through time series analysis, comparison of international data and national statistics.</p> <p>7.2 Non-trivial: No, conclusions such as the growth of non-standard employment, increased demand for digital skills and changing preferences among young people are the result of a focused analytical approach.</p> <p>7.3 Novelty: Yes, the concept is new and represents a synthesis of global and national experience with a focus on youth in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application: Broad, the results can be used to shape government youth policy and educational strategies.</p> <p>7.5 Proven in the article: Yes, the main conclusions are presented in scientific articles and reports by the applicant at conferences.</p> <p>3. Priority areas and mechanisms for ensuring youth employment in Kazakhstan in the context of global challenges.</p> <p>7.1 Proven: Yes, the conclusions are substantiated by an analysis of current employment issues, the identification of gaps in government policy, and consideration of the needs of young people.</p> <p>7.2 Non-trivial: No, the proposed system of priorities is based on evidence and reflects a strategic approach to solving the problem.</p> <p>7.3 Novelty: Yes, the dissertation offers a systematic and well-founded approach adapted to the conditions of Kazakhstan.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application: Broad, the recommendations are applicable at the national and regional levels in the formulation of state youth policy.</p> <p>7.5 Proven in the article: Yes, the main provisions are reflected in the candidate's scientific publications and reports, which confirms its scientific validity.</p>
		1) yes; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.4 Level for application:	
		1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide;	
		4) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.5 Is it proven in the article?	
		1) yes; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	

			<p>4. A model for assessing employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector, taking into account the influence of corporate identity factors, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels (WOM) on youth motivation for employment and retention.</p> <p>7.1 Proven: Yes, the model has been proven through a comprehensive analysis of factors influencing employer attractiveness in the youth labor market.</p> <p>7.2 Non-trivial: No, the proposed model is innovative as it takes into account the specific features of working with a youth audience.</p> <p>7.3 Novelty: Yes, this model has not been previously proposed in this form for analyzing employer attractiveness in Kazakhstan.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application: Broad, the model can be used in significant sectors of the economy and for developing HR strategies.</p> <p>7.5 Proven in the article: Yes, the model is presented in the applicant's scientific publications in a peer-reviewed journal and supported by empirical data.</p> <p>5. "Career Constructor" as the main tool for the professional development of graduates of vocational and higher education institutions.</p> <p>7.1 Proven: Yes, the concept was developed and substantiated in the course of the research, based on modern approaches to professional development.</p> <p>7.2 Non-trivial: No, the proposed concept differs from standard approaches in that it includes a comprehensive solution covering career paths, skills, and career support for students.</p> <p>7.3 Novelty: Yes, this provision is new as it comprehensively highlights the importance of career counseling and development at different stages of education.</p> <p>7.4 Level of application: Wide, the concept can be implemented in the educational practice of universities and colleges, as well as</p>
--	--	--	---

			<p>in the system of career counseling and training of young specialists.</p> <p>7.5 Proven in the article: Yes, the concept was presented and substantiated in the applicant's scientific articles, which were published in scientific journals.</p>
8.	Principle of Credibility	8.1 Choice of methodology - is the methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail:	<p>The chosen research methodology is scientifically sound and is explained in detail in the theoretical and analytical sections of the dissertation. The candidate has presented a systematically structured methodological framework that combines theoretical, comparative, and statistical methods of analysis. The methods used are strictly consistent with the objectives and tasks of the research and allow for an in-depth assessment of the factors influencing young people's perception of employer attractiveness in the context of digitalization and the specific characteristics of the HTTL (hospitality, travel, tourism, and leisure) sector.</p> <p>The study employs modern tools of socio-economic analysis, including a survey conducted via the specialized Webropol platform, exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis (EFA and CFA), common method bias testing, partial least squares (PLS-SEM), and regression diagnostics using SPSS and WarpPLS software. The use of PLS-SEM enabled the construction of a structural model, the identification of stable relationships between corporate identity, hiring strategies, loyalty, and employer attractiveness, as well as reliable hypothesis testing and assessment of factors influencing the behavioral intentions of young professionals. The use of modern digital tools and access to official electronic databases is clearly evident in all empirical sections of the dissertation, which increases the reliability and practical significance of the results obtained.</p> <p>The theoretical conclusions, models, identified interrelationships, and patterns are confirmed by the results of experimental studies. The paper presents well-founded theoretical propositions and logical models based on empirical data. The patterns identified in</p>
	Credibility of sources and provided information	<p><u>1) yes;</u></p> <p>2) no.</p>	
		<p>8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies:</p> <p><u>1) yes;</u></p> <p>2) no.</p>	
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, revealed interrelations and regularities are proved and confirmed by experimental research (for the directions of training in	


		pedagogical sciences the results are proved on the basis of pedagogical experiment):	the field of youth employment (e.g., the gap between training and labor market requirements, the growth of informal and flexible employment) are supported by statistical and empirical data obtained from reliable domestic and international sources.
		1) yes; 2) no.	
		8.4 Important assertions are supported /partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	
		8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient /not sufficient for a literature review.	Important statements are supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature. Key arguments and conclusions are consistently backed up by references to authoritative sources, including reports from the ILO, the World Bank, the OECD, national statistical agencies, and articles in peer-reviewed journals. The applicant demonstrates clear engagement with the academic community. The bibliographic base of the study is sufficient and includes 148 sources. The literature review is extensive and up-to-date, covering both classical economic theories and contemporary research on the youth labor market. The sources used in the study demonstrate a thorough and systematic review of the relevant academic literature and literature on youth employment policy.
9	Principle of practical value	9.1 The thesis has theoretical significance:	The dissertation makes a significant theoretical contribution to the development of labor economics. The candidate has presented an updated and multifaceted conceptualization of “effective youth employment,” which contributes to a deeper understanding of current trends in this field. The work not only systematizes global and national approaches to youth employment, but also integrates new factors such as digitalization, global changes in the labor market, and skills mismatches, thereby broadening the scope of theoretical analysis and enriching academic discussions.
		1) yes; 2) no.	
		9.2 The dissertation is of practical significance and there is a high probability that the obtained results will be applied in practice:	The dissertation has high practical significance, and the results obtained are highly likely to be applied in practice. The study developed clear and well-founded recommendations for public policy, adapted to the socio-economic environment of Kazakhstan. The proposed mechanisms, such as co-financing of wages by the state and employers, the creation of a unified digital platform for employment, and targeted measures to support youth involvement,
		1) yes; 2) no.	

			demonstrate high applicability and consistency with current government strategies. These measures can be used in the context of implementing state employment programs, contributing to improved interaction between state structures, business, and youth, which in turn will contribute to improving the employment situation of youth and creating sustainable labor markets.
		9.3 Are the practice offerings new:	The practical novelty of the dissertation lies in the development of unique and relevant solutions in the field of youth employment. The candidate clarified the concept of “effective youth employment,” proposed a conceptual model for its regulation in the context of global challenges, and identified key barriers to employment. Tools for assessing employer attractiveness and mechanisms for promoting employment have been developed, taking into account digitalization and the specific features of the Kazakhstani labor market. These proposals are highly applicable and can be used in public policy and human resource management practice.
		1) completely new ; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	
10.	Quality of writing and design	The quality of academic writing is	The dissertation is formatted in accordance with academic writing requirements and is distinguished by its logical structure, consistent presentation of material, and scientific style of exposition. The text is written in clear and accessible language, which facilitates better understanding of the research conclusions. The language is of high quality and highlights the high level of academic training of the candidate.
		1) high ; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	
11.	Comments on the dissertation	Minor stylistic features of the presentation do not detract from the overall academic quality of the material.	
12.	Scientific level of doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of thesis defense in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the topic of research)	The candidate’s scientific publications on the topic of the dissertation have been published in journals recommended by Science and Higher Education Quality Assurance Committee of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in publications indexed in the Scopus database. The main provisions and conclusions of the dissertation are reflected in these articles, which confirms the high scientific quality of the work. The publications are characterized by in-depth theoretical analysis, original ideas, and a significant contribution to the development of the field of research. The empirical basis and methodology used ensure the reliability and validity of the results, which meet modern academic standards.	

13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the Standard Provisions)	Awarding of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics».
-----	--	--

The dissertation work of Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms » meets the requirements for dissertations for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics».

Official Reviewer,
Cand. Sc. (Econ.),
Associate Professor of Almaty
Humanitarian-Economic University



Yeshpanova D.D.

