

## REVIEW OF THE OFFICIAL REVIEWER

**on the dissertation work of Sadyk Dina**  
**«Developing an augmented multidimensional CBBE model for social media brand Instagram: its applications to the role of brand index (RBI)»**  
**for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)**  
**on the educational program 8D04106 – «Marketing»**

№ п/п	Criteria	Meeting the criteria	Justification of the official reviewer's position
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs.	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs: 1) the dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program funded from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program); 2) the dissertation was completed within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program); 3) the dissertation corresponds to the priority area of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction).	1) The dissertation was not conducted within the framework of a specific project or target program funded from the state budget. 2) While not directly part of a designated state program, the dissertation's focus corresponds with the objectives of the State Program for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2025. This program emphasizes the integration of digital technologies into education and science, promoting research that contributes to the digital transformation of various sectors, including marketing and brand management. The dissertation's development of a digital brand equity model for Instagram aligns with these goals by providing insights into digital consumer behavior and brand valuation. 3) The research corresponds to the priority areas of «Intellectual Potential of the Country» and «Advanced Production, Digital and Space Technologies», as approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the 2024–2026 period. This priority area encompasses research and innovation in digital technologies, including social media platforms, digital marketing, and data analytics. The dissertation's focus on developing a customer-based brand equity model tailored for Instagram directly contributes to this domain by enhancing understanding and methodologies in digital brand management and marketing analytics.
2.	Importance for science	The work <u>does/does not make</u> a significant contribution to science, and its importance is <u>well disclosed/not disclosed</u> .	The dissertation makes a significant contribution to the field of marketing science by proposing a novel theoretical model that integrates value co-creation into the traditional CBBE framework, specifically adapted to the Instagram platform. This innovative approach addresses a clear gap in brand equity research within digital environments and offers a validated empirical structure using advanced statistical techniques such as SEM, EFA, and CFA. The study's findings enhance the understanding of consumer engagement, electronic word-of-mouth, and social value in shaping brand equity, and provide practical implications for digital brand management. Moreover, the research aligns with Kazakhstan's scientific development priorities in the field of digital technologies, thereby strengthening its academic and societal relevance.
3.	The principle of independence	The level of independence: 1) <u>High</u> ;	The dissertation demonstrates a high level of independence in its execution, reflecting the author's ability to carry out complex scientific research autonomously. From the formulation



		2) Medium 3) Low; 4) No independence	<p>of the research problem to the development of the augmented multidimensional CBBE model tailored to Instagram, the author shows initiative in identifying a relevant gap in marketing science and offering a novel theoretical and methodological solution. The comprehensive literature review, critical synthesis of existing models, and conceptual integration of value co-creation mechanisms indicate that the research was not only guided by existing frameworks but significantly extended them through original thinking.</p> <p>The empirical phase of the dissertation was independently designed and implemented, involving the collection and analysis of a large dataset, the application of advanced statistical methods (EFA, CFA, SEM), and the testing of complex mediation relationships. The candidate also demonstrated independent decision-making in developing practical recommendations and validating the model with real business cases, which confirms the applied value and practical orientation of the research. The dissertation reflects a high degree of scientific maturity and independence appropriate for the level of PhD qualification.</p>
4.	The principle of internal unity	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <u>Justified</u>;  2) Partially justified;  3) Not substantiated.</p> <p>4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p>1) <u>Reflects</u>;  2) Partially reflects;  3) Does not reflect.</p>	<p>The principle of internal unity in the dissertation is fully observed. The relevance of the research is clearly justified in the introductory section, where the author identifies a significant gap in the current understanding and assessment of customer-based brand equity (CBBE) within the context of social media platforms, particularly Instagram. The growing role of social networks in brand development, combined with the lack of unified, open-access models to measure brand value in digital environments, establishes a strong rationale for the study. The author convincingly argues that traditional brand valuation approaches fail to account for the unique mechanisms of consumer word-of-mouth, engagement, and co-creation prevalent on platforms like Instagram, thereby reinforcing the importance of developing a new, augmented CBBE model.</p> <p>This justification is not only theoretically well-grounded but also supported by practical needs in the marketing industry and aligned with national digitalization goals. The formulated research aim and objectives logically stem from the identified problem and are consistently addressed throughout the dissertation. The structure of the dissertation reflects this internal logic, with each chapter systematically building upon the previous one—from the theoretical framework to empirical testing and practical recommendations—ensuring coherence and integrity across the entire work.</p> <p>The content of the dissertation fully reflects its stated topic, as each section directly contributes to the development and empirical validation of an augmented multidimensional CBBE model for Instagram and its application to the Role of Brand Index (RBI). The theoretical chapters provide a solid conceptual foundation for understanding brand equity in digital environments, while the empirical sections rigorously test the proposed model using data from Instagram users. The findings and practical recommendations are directly aligned with the dissertation's aim, ensuring that the research topic is comprehensively addressed both in scope and depth.</p>



5.	The principle of scientific novelty	<p>4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation:</p> <p><u>1) correspond to;</u></p> <p>2) partially correspond;</p> <p>3) do not correspond</p>	<p>The purpose and objectives of the dissertation fully correspond to its topic, as they are clearly formulated to address the development of an augmented multidimensional CBBE model specifically adapted for the Instagram platform and its application to the Role of Brand Index (RBI). Each objective logically supports the overall research aim—from theoretical exploration and model construction to empirical testing and practical implementation—ensuring a consistent and focused approach throughout the dissertation. This alignment underscores the coherence between the research topic, its goals, and the methodological framework applied.</p>
		<p>4.4 All sections and provisions of the dissertation are logically interrelated:</p> <p><u>1) fully interrelated;</u></p> <p>2) partially interrelated;</p> <p>3) there is no interrelated.</p>	<p>All sections and provisions of the dissertation are fully interrelated, demonstrating a strong internal logic and coherence across the entire work. The theoretical analysis in the first chapter lays the foundation for the conceptual model, which is empirically tested in the second chapter through robust quantitative methods. The third chapter builds upon these findings by offering practical recommendations and demonstrating the model's applicability in real business contexts. Each chapter naturally follows from the previous one, and the conclusions are clearly derived from the empirical results, reflecting a well-structured and logically connected research process.</p>
		<p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions:</p> <p><u>1) there is a critical analysis;</u></p> <p>2) the analysis is partial;</p> <p>3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors.</p>	<p>The dissertation presents new solutions—namely, the augmented multidimensional CBBE model for social media brand Instagram—which are thoroughly reasoned and supported by a critical analysis of existing approaches. The author systematically compares the proposed model with traditional CBBE frameworks and established brand valuation methods, such as those used in offline marketing and proprietary models like Interbrand's RBI. Through a detailed literature review and theoretical synthesis, the dissertation highlights the limitations of current models in capturing consumer engagement and value co-creation on digital platforms. The proposed model is then evaluated against these known solutions, demonstrating its conceptual and practical advantages in addressing the dynamics of brand equity in the social media environment.</p>
		<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?</p> <p><u>1) Completely new;</u></p> <p>2) partially new (25-75% are new);</p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The scientific results and provisions presented in the dissertation are completely new. The research introduces an original augmented multidimensional CBBE model specifically designed for the Instagram platform, integrating value co-creation, user engagement, electronic word-of-mouth, and social value—dimensions not previously combined in this context. This model represents a novel theoretical and methodological contribution to the field of marketing science. Furthermore, the study offers a new approach to applying the CBBE framework in calculating the Role of Brand Index (RBI) within digital environments, bridging the gap between consumer perception metrics and brand financial valuation—an area that has not been thoroughly explored in prior research.</p>



6.	Validity of the main conclusions	<p>5.2 Are the conclusions of the thesis new?</p> <p>1) <u>Completely new</u>;  2) partially new (25-75% are new);  3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation are completely new, as they offer original insights into the formation and assessment of customer-based brand equity in the context of social media, specifically Instagram. The research empirically confirms the mediating role of value co-creation in enhancing brand equity and demonstrates how this mechanism can be quantitatively linked to the Role of Brand Index (RBI), thereby extending existing theories and practices in brand valuation. These conclusions not only validate the proposed model but also provide a novel methodological basis for integrating consumer engagement metrics into financial assessments of brand strength in digital environments.</p>
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and justified:</p> <p>1) <u>Completely new</u>;  2) partially new (25-75% are new);  3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>The managerial and methodological decisions proposed in the dissertation are completely new and well justified. The study introduces an original, empirically validated framework for assessing brand equity on Instagram by integrating previously unlinked dimensions such as value co-creation, user engagement, and electronic word-of-mouth into a unified model. This approach offers brand managers a novel tool for diagnosing and enhancing brand strength in digital environments. Furthermore, the dissertation presents a new method for applying the augmented CBBE model to calculate the Role of Brand Index (RBI), providing a practical solution for linking marketing performance with financial valuation—an innovative contribution to both marketing management and strategic brand assessment.</p>
		<p>All the main conclusions are <u>based/not based on scientifically significant evidence</u> or are <u>well-founded enough</u> (for qualitative research and areas of study in the arts and humanities).</p>	<p>All the main conclusions of the dissertation are based on scientifically significant evidence. The author employs a robust methodological framework, including exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis as well as structural equation modeling, to test the proposed hypotheses and validate the augmented CBBE model. The conclusions are drawn from empirical data collected from a large and representative sample of Instagram users, ensuring the reliability and generalizability of the findings. Each conclusion is logically derived from the results of the statistical analyses and is supported by theoretical reasoning and comparison with existing literature, confirming their scientific validity and relevance.</p>
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	<p>It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:</p> <p>7.1 Has the situation been proven?</p> <p>1) proven;  2) rather proven;  3) rather not proven;  4) not proven;  5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) yes;</p>	<p><i>Provision 1: A proprietary interpretation of «social media brand equity» is presented as a value co-created by users through electronic word-of-mouth, engagement, and the social value of the brand.</i></p> <p>7.1 Has the situation been proven?</p> <p>1) Proven  2) No</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>2) No</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) Yes</p> <p>7.4 Application level:</p> <p>3) Wide</p> <p>7.5 Is it proved in the article?</p> <p>1) Yes</p>

2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the triviality of the position.	Provision is proven in the article «Sadyk D. Conceptualization Of Social Media Brand Equity. – Press Academia Procedia (PAP), 2020. – P. 84-87.»
7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the novelty of the provision.	<i>Provision 2: The use of a brand equity model (SEM) is proposed for analyzing user demand in order to determine the contribution of the brand name to Instagram brand valuation through net present value.</i> 7.1 Has the situation been proven? 1) Proven 7.2 Is it trivial? 2) No 7.3 Is it new? 1) Yes 7.4 Application level: 3) Wide 7.5 Is it proved in the article? 1) Yes
7.4 Application level: 1) narrow; 2) Average; 3) Wide; 4) in the current wording, it is impossible to verify the level of application of the provision.	Provision is proven in the article «Sadyk D., Islam D.M. Usage intention towards the brand contribution index for brand valuation of social media. - 18 th KIRC Proceedings, 2021. – P. 122-131.»
7.5 Is it proved in the article? 1) yes; 2) no; 3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the evidence of the provision in the article.	<i>Provision 3: The evaluation of the Instagram brand equity model showed that the intensity of user co-creation influences the size of brand equity, being an integral part of it.</i> 7.1 Has the situation been proven? 1) Proven This finding is empirically demonstrated using structural equation modeling (SEM), where user co-creation acts as a significant predictor of brand equity dimensions. The statistical analysis confirms its integral role within the proposed model. 7.2 Is it trivial? 2) No The idea that co-creation is not just supportive but central to brand equity formation on Instagram represents a meaningful and non-obvious insight within digital marketing theory. 7.3 Is it new? 1) Yes While co-creation has been studied in branding, this dissertation is among the first to quantify its influence on brand equity in a social media context, specifically Instagram, using a validated mode 7.4 Application level: 3) Wide



The insight is widely applicable to digital marketing strategies, particularly in industries where user participation and brand interaction are essential for brand building.

7.5 Is it proved in the article?

1) Yes

Provision is proven in the article «Sadyk D., Islam D.M. Brand equity and usage intention powered by value co-creation: a case of Instagram in Kazakhstan //Sustainability. – 2022. – Vol. 14, № 1. – P. 500.»

*Provision 4: The level of user engagement, the intensity of electronic word-of-mouth, and the significance of the brand's social value determine user co-creation activity in building and strengthening the Instagram brand.*

7.1 Has the situation been proven?

1) Proven

7.2 Is it trivial?

2) No

7.3 Is it new?

1) Yes

7.4 Application level:

3) Wide

7.5 Is it proved in the article?

1) Yes

Provision is proven in the article «Sadyk D., Islam D.M. Theoretical background for social media marketing research: An example of value co-creation theory application //И.И. Гумилев атындағы ЕҰУ хабаршысының экономика сериясы. – 2021. - № 2. – P. 112-127.»

*Provision 5: The brand equity model evaluates the effectiveness of brands' marketing activities on Instagram.*

7.1 Has the situation been proven?

1) Proven

7.2 Is it trivial?

2) No

7.3 Is it new?

1) Yes

7.4 Application level:

3) Wide

7.5 Is it proved in the article?

1) Yes

Provision is proven in the articles:

		<p>1) Sadyk D., Islam D.M. Brand equity and usage intention powered by value co-creation: a case of Instagram in Kazakhstan //Sustainability. – 2022. – Vol. 14, № 1. – P. 500.</p> <p>2) Sadyk D. A theoretical contribution of social media factors towards customer-based brand equity //Қазақстан Республикасы Ұлттық инженерлік академиясының хабаршысы. – 2020. Vol. 76, №2. – P. 233-237.</p>
8.	<p>The principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and information provided</p> <p>8.1 The choice of methodology is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail:  <u>1) yes;</u>  2) no</p>	<p>The principle of reliability is fully upheld in the dissertation, with the chosen methodology clearly justified and described in sufficient detail. The author provides a comprehensive rationale for using Structural Equation Modeling (SEM), including preliminary procedures such as exploratory factor analysis (EFA) and confirmatory factor analysis (CFA), to test the hypothesized relationships within the augmented CBBE model. The data preparation steps, sampling strategy, statistical software used, and validity checks (e.g., reliability coefficients, model fit indices, mediation analysis) are all transparently outlined. This methodological transparency ensures that the research process is replicable and the findings are scientifically sound.</p>
	<p>8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern scientific research methods and methods of data processing and interpretation using computer technology:  <u>1) yes;</u>  2) no</p>	<p>Yes, the results of the dissertation were obtained using modern scientific research methods and advanced data processing techniques supported by computer technology. The author employed up-to-date quantitative methods, including Structural Equation Modeling (SEM), Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA), Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA), and mediation analysis using tools such as SPSS and WarpPLS. These approaches allowed for rigorous testing of hypotheses, validation of constructs, and accurate interpretation of complex relationships within the model. The use of specialized software ensured precision, reproducibility, and adherence to current standards in empirical research.</p>
	<p>8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):  <u>1) yes;</u>  2) no</p>	<p>Yes, the theoretical conclusions, conceptual model, and identified relationships in the dissertation have been thoroughly proven and confirmed through experimental research. The author conducted an empirical study involving a large and representative sample of Instagram users, applying advanced statistical techniques such as SEM to validate the proposed augmented CBBE model. The relationships between key constructs—user engagement, eWOM, social value, co-creation, and brand equity—were statistically confirmed, demonstrating both the theoretical soundness and empirical robustness of the model. This evidence-based validation ensures the scientific credibility of the research outcomes.</p>
	<p>8.4 Important statements are <u>confirmed</u>/partially confirmed/not confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.</p>	<p>Yes, all important statements in the dissertation are confirmed by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature. The author demonstrates a deep engagement with both classical and contemporary sources in marketing, brand equity, consumer behavior, and digital communication. The literature review includes 256 references from peer-reviewed journals, indexed databases (e.g., Scopus, Web of Science), and foundational theoretical works. Key theoretical concepts—such as value co-creation, electronic word-of-mouth, and customer-based brand equity—are consistently supported by authoritative sources, ensuring the academic validity and reliability of the dissertation's arguments and conclusions.</p>



		<p>8.5 The literature sources used are <u>sufficient</u>/not sufficient for a literary review.</p>	<p>Yes, the literature sources used in the dissertation are fully sufficient for a comprehensive literary review. The author cites 256 scholarly sources, covering a wide range of foundational theories, empirical studies, and recent advancements in marketing, brand equity, social media analytics, and consumer engagement. The sources include high-impact journals and reputable databases such as Scopus and Web of Science, reflecting both the depth and breadth of the literature consulted. This extensive and up-to-date bibliographic base ensures that the research is well-grounded in the current scientific discourse and meets the standards of a doctoral-level review.</p>
9	The principle of practical value	<p>9.1 The thesis has theoretical significance:  <u>1) yes;</u>  2) no</p> <p>9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice:  <u>1) yes;</u>  2) no</p> <p>9.3 Suggestions for practice are new:  <u>1) Completely new;</u>  2) partially new (25-75% are new);  3) not new (less than 25% are new).</p>	<p>Yes, the thesis has clear theoretical significance. It introduces a novel conceptualization of social media brand equity by integrating value co-creation, user engagement, electronic word-of-mouth, and social value into an augmented multidimensional CBBE model specifically designed for the Instagram platform. This model extends existing branding theories and contributes to academic discourse by offering a framework that captures the unique dynamics of brand-building in digital environments. The theoretical insights enrich the understanding of consumer-brand interactions in social media contexts and provide a foundation for future research in marketing and brand management.</p> <p>Yes, the thesis is of practical importance, and there is a high probability of applying the results in real-world practice. The augmented CBBE model developed by the author serves as a practical tool for evaluating and enhancing brand equity on Instagram, providing actionable insights for brand managers, marketers, and digital strategists. The dissertation includes case-based validation with real companies (e.g., Jacobs and Beauty Flora), demonstrating the model's applicability in assessing marketing effectiveness and brand performance. The results can be used to guide marketing decisions, optimize user engagement strategies, and inform brand valuation processes, making the research highly relevant for industry implementation.</p> <p>Yes, the suggestions for practice presented in the dissertation are completely new. The author proposes an original, empirically validated framework for evaluating brand equity in the context of Instagram, incorporating user co-creation, electronic word-of-mouth, engagement, and social value—dimensions not previously combined in practical branding tools. These recommendations offer innovative approaches for measuring and managing brand performance on social media, including the integration of brand equity metrics into financial valuation models such as the Role of Brand Index (RBI). Such applications are novel and represent a significant advancement in digital marketing practice.</p>
10.	Quality of writing and design	<p>The quality of academic writing:  <u>1) High</u>  2) Average;  3) Below average;  4) Low.</p>	<p>The quality of academic writing in the dissertation is high. The text is written in a clear, formal, and logically structured manner, adhering to the standards of scientific style and academic discourse. Terminology is used accurately and consistently, arguments are well-articulated, and complex theoretical and methodological concepts are explained with precision. Each section flows coherently into the next, and the structure of the dissertation effectively supports the development of the research problem, analysis, and conclusions.</p>



		Overall, the writing demonstrates scholarly maturity and strong command of academic conventions.
11.	Notes to the dissertation	<p>Minor notes include:</p> <p>1) <i>In the introduction, the research objectives are listed, but each task is presented briefly, without elaborating on the underlying scientific issues;</i></p> <p>2) <i>Key concepts such as "value co-creation" and "social brand value" are used without prior definition at their first mention in the text;</i></p> <p>3) <i>Some visual elements (diagrams, structural models) appear overly dense, which may hinder comprehension of complex variable relationships;</i></p> <p>4) <i>The practical testing of the model is conducted on two brand cases, but the comparative insights between them are not fully explored.</i></p>
12.	The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles on the research topic (in the case of a dissertation defense in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the research topic)	The scientific level of the doctoral student's articles is high and fully corresponds to the requirements for PhD-level research. The main results of the dissertation have been published in 7 scientific papers, demonstrating a solid and well-balanced publication record. Notably, 1 article is published in a ranked journal indexed in the Scopus database with a percentile above 35, which reflects the international relevance and academic rigor of the research. Additionally, 3 articles are published in journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in the Sphere of Science and Higher Education (CQASHE) of Kazakhstan, confirming national recognition and alignment with state standards for doctoral output. The remaining 3 publications in proceedings of international scientific and practical conferences indicate active participation in the scientific community and dissemination of research findings to professional audiences. Collectively, the publication portfolio reflects both the originality and scientific maturity of the dissertation research.
13.	The decision of the official reviewer	Having thoroughly reviewed the dissertation «Developing an augmented multidimensional CBBE model for social media brand Instagram: its applications to the role of brand index (RBI)» by Dina Sadyk, I affirm that the work meets all the formal and substantive requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04106 – «Marketing». The dissertation demonstrates a high level of scientific originality, internal coherence, theoretical and practical relevance, and methodological rigor. The main research provisions are novel, proven, and hold wide applicability. The doctoral candidate has shown the ability to independently conduct significant scientific research, and the results are validated through high-quality publications, including one in a Scopus-indexed journal. Based on the results of the review, I conclude that the dissertation of Dina Sadyk merits a positive evaluation and recommend it for public defense, and support awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04106 – «Marketing»

**Official Reviewer:**

**PhD, Associate Professor**  
**Kenzhegali Sagadiyev University of International Business**



**Nurbatsin Akan Seitkanuly**

