

## REVIEW

of the official reviewer on the dissertation work of

**Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms», for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)**  
**on the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics»**

№ п/п	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs:	<p>The dissertation aligns with the priority areas of scientific development as established by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan:</p> <p>“Research in the field of social and humanitarian sciences”</p> <p>1) The dissertation was prepared under the completed grant project financed from the state budget AP09260584 ‘Restructuring of employment of Kazakhstan in conditions of socio-economic tension’ (2021-2023) and the current grant project funded by the state budget AP23488981 ‘Transformation of Kazakhstan's labor resources against the background of technological challenges: new quality, model,</p>
		1) <u>The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</u>	
		2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);	
		3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)	

			scenarios' (2024-2026), where the candidate is the responsible party and a member of the research group.
2.	Importance for science	The work <u>does/does not make</u> a significant contribution to science and its importance <u>is well-disclosed/not disclosed</u>	<p>The dissertation research constitutes a significant scientific contribution, as evidenced by the high relevance of the issues explored:</p> <p>1)the author's interpretation of the economic nature of the concept of "effective youth employment" in the face of emerging global challenges, offering a contemporary understanding of this phenomenon amid labor market transformations;</p> <p>2) a new concept for employment provision within the modern economy, taking into account structural shifts in the employment landscape;</p> <p>3)key priorities and mechanisms for promoting youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan, particularly in the context of global challenges such as digitalization, economic instability, and transformations in the educational system;</p>

			<p>4) a model for evaluating employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector, incorporating the impact of corporate identity, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels (e.g., word-of-mouth) on young people's motivation to seek and retain employment;</p> <p>5) the "Career Constructor" as a foundational tool aimed at supporting the professional development of graduates from both vocational and higher education institutions.</p>
3.	Principle of autonomy	<p>Level of autonomy:</p> <p>1) <u>high</u>;</p> <p>2) medium;</p> <p>3) low;</p> <p>4) no independence.</p>	<p>The dissertation reflects a strong level of scholarly independence, with its structure, that defines the sequential stages of scientific inquiry. It showcases the author's capability to independently design and execute research activities. The author conducted a thorough critical analysis of existing scientific literature, identified unresolved issues within the current body of research, and introduced original approaches to address these gaps.</p>
4.	Principle of internal unity	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:</p> <p>1) <u>justified</u>;</p> <p>2) partially justified;</p>	<p>The significance of the chosen research topic is convincingly substantiated. The author effectively identifies key</p>

	3) not substantiated.	challenges associated with youth employment on both a global scale and within the specific context of Kazakhstan. Moreover, the study underscores the urgent need to develop effective strategies and instruments to support youth employment, thereby demonstrating its theoretical relevance and practical value.
	4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic:	The content of the dissertation is fully aligned with its stated research topic.
	1) <u>reflects</u> ;	
	2) partially reflects;	
	3) does not reflect.	
	4.3. The purpose and objectives are consistent with the thesis topic:	The aim and objectives of the research are well-aligned with the dissertation topic.
	1) <u>correspond to</u> ;	
	2) partially correspond;	
	3) do not correspond.	
	4.4 All sections and statements of the thesis are logically interrelated:	The dissertation is organized in a logical and fully coherent manner, with a clear internal consistency throughout the work.
	1) <u>fully interrelated</u> ;	
	2) partially interrelated;	
	3) there is no interrelation.	
	4.5 New solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:	The candidate carried out a critical assessment of existing studies on youth employment within the framework of global challenges, utilizing a broad spectrum of both national and international
	1) <u>there is critical analysis</u> ;	
	2) the analysis is partial;	

		3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors;	academic sources. The research includes an in-depth analysis of the current state of Kazakhstan's youth labor market, alongside an evaluation of government educational initiatives aimed at promoting youth employment. Furthermore, the study emphasizes the importance of employer attractiveness as a pivotal factor in enhancing youth employment opportunities in Kazakhstan.
		4) no analysis.	
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?	The scientific results and provisions presented in the dissertation are completely new, specifically: 1) the author formulates a novel interpretation of the economic essence of "effective youth employment" in the context of emerging global challenges, taking into account contemporary transformational processes occurring in the labor market; 2) a new conceptual framework for employment support in the modern economy is proposed, reflecting the impact of structural shifts in the labor market; 3) key priorities and mechanisms for promoting youth employment in Kazakhstan are identified, with particular consideration of global
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	

			<p>and technological challenges such as digitalization, economic volatility, and transformations within the systems of higher and vocational education;</p> <p>4) a model for evaluating employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector (hospitality, tourism, transport, and logistics) has been developed, incorporating factors such as corporate culture, recruitment practices, and informal communication channels (e.g., word of mouth) that influence young people's employment motivation and workplace retention;</p> <p>5) a "Career Constructor" has been designed as a strategic tool aimed at fostering the development of new competencies and enhancing the qualifications of graduates from vocational and higher education institutions.</p>
		5.2 The conclusions of the thesis are new?	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation regarding the ensuring of youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan, within the context of modern global challenges, are completely new.</p>
		1) completely new;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new)	

		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and reasonable:	The economic solutions presented are completely new in the development of mechanisms and recommendations for securing youth employment in Kazakhstan amid emerging global challenges.
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	
6.	The validity of the main conclusions	All major conclusions <u>are</u> /are not <u>based</u> on scientifically rigorous evidence or <u>are reasonably well supported</u> (for qualitative research and arts and humanities training areas).	The key conclusions are well-founded and supported by empirical data, consistent with the analytical methods used in the research.
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	The following questions need to be answered for each provision individually:	1)the author's interpretation of the economic nature of the concept of "effective employment" in light of new global challenges is proposed. 7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4level of application: wide 7.5 proven and supported by a scientific article; 2)a concept of employment provision for youth in the context of the modern economy is developed, considering the structural changes in the employment sector. 7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial;
		7.1 Is the provision proven?	
		1) <u>proven</u> ;	
		2) rather proven;	
		3) rather not proven;	
		4) not proven.	
		5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.2 Is it trivial?	
		1) yes;	
		2) <u>no</u> ;	
		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.3 Is it new?	
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no;	



		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	7.3 the provision is new;
		7.4 Level for application:	7.4 level of application: wide
		1) narrow;	7.5 proven and supported by scientific articles;
		2) medium;	3) the priorities and mechanisms for promoting youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan are outlined, considering global challenges such as digitalization, economic instability, and changes in the educational landscape.
		3) <u>wide</u> ;	7.1 proven;
		4) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	7.2 non-trivial;
		7.5 Is it proven in the article?	7.3 the provision is new;
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	7.4 level of application: wide
		2) no;	7.5 proven and supported by a scientific article;
		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	4) a model for evaluating employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector has been created, considering the impact of factors such as corporate identity, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels (e.g., word-of-mouth) on youth motivation for employment and retention.
			7.1 proven;
			7.2 non-trivial;
			7.3 the provision is new;



			<p>7.4 level of application: wide</p> <p>7.5 proven and supported by a scientific article;</p> <p>5) the "Career Constructor" has been developed as a key tool for the professional development of graduates from vocational and higher education institutions.</p> <p>7.1 proven;</p> <p>7.2 non-trivial;</p> <p>7.3 the provision is new;</p> <p>7.4 level of application: wide</p> <p>7.5 proven and supported by a scientific article.</p>
8.	Principle of Credibility	8.1 Choice of methodology - is the methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail:	The research methodology is thoroughly justified and comprehensively detailed in the theoretical and analytical chapters.
	Credibility of sources and provided information	1) yes;	
		2) no.	
		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies:	The dissertation results were obtained through the application of contemporary scientific research methods, along with data processing and interpretation techniques utilizing computer technologies such as SPSS and Smart PLS.
		1) yes;	
		2) no.	
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, revealed interrelations and regularities are proved and confirmed by experimental research (for the directions of training in pedagogical sciences the results are proved on the basis of pedagogical experiment):	Theoretical conclusions, models, and identified relationships and patterns are validated and

		1) <u>yes</u> ;	supported by experimental research.
		2) no.	
		8.4 Important assertions are <u>supported</u> /partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	Key assertions are backed by references to pertinent and credible scientific literature.
		8.5 Used literature sources <u>are sufficient</u> /not sufficient for a literature review.	The bibliographic base of the study is adequate, comprising 148 sources.
9	Principle of practical value	9.1 The thesis has theoretical significance:	The dissertation holds theoretical significance.
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no.	
		9.2 The dissertation is of practical significance and there is a high probability that the obtained results will be applied in practice:	The dissertation has practical relevance, with a strong likelihood that the findings can be applied in practice.
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no.	
		9.3 Are the practice offerings new:	The practical offerings are completely new.
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new)	
10.	Quality of writing and design	The quality of academic writing is	The dissertation is written in scientific language, featuring a logically organized and coherent structure. The academic writing is of a high standard, reflecting excellent presentation.
		1) <u>high</u> ;	
		2) average;	
		3) below average;	
		4) low.	

11.	Comments on the dissertation	The dissertation is a work of high scientific merit, showcasing a deep understanding of the research topic and offering original approaches. The theoretical contributions are well-developed, providing new perspectives on youth employment issues. The methodology employed is robust and suitable, ensuring the reliability of the results. The empirical foundation is solid, adding practical value to the findings. The structure of the work is coherent and logical, facilitating a clear understanding of the research progression. The practical implications of the study are significant, particularly in offering actionable recommendations to improve youth employment in Kazakhstan. In sum, the dissertation makes a valuable contribution to both academic knowledge and practical solutions in the area of youth employment.
12.	Scientific level of doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of thesis defense in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the topic of research)	The articles submitted by the candidate reflect a high scientific level, demonstrating a profound understanding and detailed analysis of the considering research problem. Each article is firmly anchored in contemporary scientific theories, presenting original ideas and making a notable contribution to the field. The empirical foundation of the studies is solid, and the methodology used is thorough, ensuring the reliability and validity of the outcomes. Overall, the candidate's work adheres to the highest academic standards, underscoring their strong research abilities.
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the Standard Provisions)	The dissertation work of Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms » meets the requirements for dissertations for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics».

**Official Reviewer,**  
PhD,  
Associate Professor of Narxoz University



Sagidolda N.

02.05.2025