

REVIEW

of the official reviewer on the dissertation work of

Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms», for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
on the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics»

№ п/п	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of the official reviewer's position (comments in italics)
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs:</p> <p>1) <u>The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</u></p> <p>2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program);</p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)</p>	<p>The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of scientific development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan: “Research in the field of social and humanitarian sciences”.</p> <p>1)The dissertation was performed within the framework of a completed grant project financed from the state budget AP09260584 ‘Restructuring of employment of Kazakhstan in conditions of socio-economic tension’ (2021-2023) and the ongoing grant project funded by the state budget AP23488981 ‘Transformation of Kazakhstan's labor resources against the background of</p>

			technological challenges: new quality, model, scenarios' (2024-2026), in which the candidate is the executor and a member of the research group.
2.	Importance for science	The work <u>does/does not make</u> a significant contribution to science and its importance <u>is well-disclosed/not disclosed</u>	<p>The dissertation research makes a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well demonstrated by the relevance of the issues under consideration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the author's vision of the economic essence of the concept of "effective youth employment" in the context of new global challenges is presented, which reflects the modern content of this phenomenon in the context of labor market transformation; - the concept of employment provision in the conditions of modern economy, which takes into account structural changes in the sphere of employment, is formulated; - priorities and mechanisms of ensuring youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the context of global challenges, including digitalization, instability

			<p>of economic processes and changes in the educational environment are defined;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a model for assessing employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector has been developed, taking into account the influence of corporate identity factors, recruitment strategies, and informal communication channels (WOM) on youth motivation for employment and retention; - “Career constructor” as a fundamental tool for professional development of graduates of vocational and higher education institutions is developed.
3.	Principle of autonomy	Level of autonomy:	The dissertation demonstrates a high degree of independence, with a structure that defines the stages of scientific research, highlighting the author’s ability to independently plan and conduct scholarly work. The author carried out a critical review of the scientific literature, identified gaps in current research, and proposed original approaches to address them.
		1) high;	
		2) medium;	
		3) low;	
		4) no independence.	
4.	Principle of internal unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:	

		1) <u>justified</u> ;	The relevance of the selected research topic is well justified. The author has identified the challenges related to youth employment globally, as well as specifically within Kazakhstan. Furthermore, the study emphasizes the necessity of developing effective mechanisms and tools to promote youth employment, highlighting both its theoretical importance and practical applicability.
		2) partially justified;	
		3) not substantiated.	
		4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic:	The content of the dissertation reflects its topic.
		1) <u>reflects</u> ;	
		2) partially reflects;	
		3) does not reflect.	
		4.3. The purpose and objectives are consistent with the thesis topic:	The goal and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation.
		1) <u>correspond to</u> ;	
		2) partially correspond;	
		3) do not correspond.	
		4.4 All sections and statements of the thesis are logically interrelated:	The content of the dissertation is logically structured, fully cohesive, and demonstrates internal consistency.
		1) <u>fully interrelated</u> ;	
		2) partially interrelated;	
		3) there is no interrelation.	
		4.5 New solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:	The candidate conducted a critical evaluation of existing research on youth employment within the

		1) <u>there is critical analysis</u> ;	broader context of global challenges, drawing from both domestic and international scholarly sources. A comprehensive analysis of the current situation in Kazakhstan's youth labor market was carried out, along with an assessment of state educational programs designed to support youth employment in the country. Additionally, the study highlighted the significance of employer appeal as a key factor in facilitating youth employment in Kazakhstan.
		2) the analysis is partial;	
		3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors;	
		4) no analysis.	
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?	The scientific results and provisions presented in the dissertation are completely new, in particular: 1) the author proposes a new interpretation of the economic nature of 'effective youth employment' in the context of new global challenges, taking into account contemporary transformation processes in the labour market; 2) a new concept of employment support in the modern economy is proposed, taking into account
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	

			<p>structural shifts in the labour market;</p> <p>3) key priorities and mechanisms for ensuring youth employment in Kazakhstan are identified, taking into account global and technological challenges such as digitalisation, economic instability and new processes in the higher and vocational education system;</p> <p>4) a model for assessing the attractiveness of employers in the HTTL sector (hospitality, tourism, transport and logistics) has been developed, including factors such as corporate culture, recruitment strategies and informal communication channels (e.g. word of mouth) that influence young people's motivation to find employment and their retention in the workplace;</p> <p>5) a 'Career constructor' has been developed as a fundamental tool to support the development of new skills and improve the qualifications of graduates of vocational and higher education institutions.</p>
		5.2 The conclusions of the thesis are new?	

		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	The conclusions of the dissertation on ensuring youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the context of modern global challenges are completely new.
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new)	
		5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and reasonable:	Economic solutions are completely new in the development of mechanisms and recommendation for ensuring youth employment in Kazakhstan in the conditions of new global challenges.
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
		3) not new (less than 25% are new).	
6.	The validity of the main conclusions	All major conclusions <u>are/are not based</u> on scientifically rigorous evidence or <u>are reasonably well supported</u> (for qualitative research and arts and humanities training areas).	The main conclusions are thoroughly justified and backed by empirical evidence, aligned with the analytical methods employed in the research.
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	The following questions need to be answered for each provision individually:	1)The author's vision of the economic essence of the concept of "effective employment" in the conditions of new global challenges is proposed. 7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4level of application: wide 7.5 proven and substantiated by a scientific article; 2)The concept of employment provision in the conditions of
		7.1 Is the provision proven?	
		1) <u>proven</u> ;	
		2) rather proven;	
		3) rather not proven;	
		4) not proven.	
		5) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.2 Is it trivial?	
		1) yes;	
		2) <u>no</u> ;	

		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	modern economy, which takes into account structural changes in the sphere of employment, is developed. 7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4 level of application: wide 7.5 proven and substantiated in scientific works (articles); 3) Priorities and mechanisms of ensuring youth employment in the Republic of Kazakhstan in the context of global challenges, including digitalization, instability of economic processes and changes in the educational environment are defined. 7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4 level of application: wide 7.5 proven and substantiated by a scientific article; 4)a model for assessing employer attractiveness in the HTTL sector has been developed, taking into account the influence of corporate identity factors, recruitment strategies, and informal
		7.3 Is it new?	
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no;	
		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.4 Level for application:	
		1) narrow;	
		2) medium;	
		3) <u>wide</u> ;	
		4) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	
		7.5 Is it proven in the article?	
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no;	
		3) in the current formulation, it is impossible to verify the validity of the provision.	

			<p>communication channels (WOM) on youth motivation for employment and retention.</p> <p>7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4 level of application: wide 7.5 proven and substantiated by a scientific article;</p> <p>5)“Career constructor” as a fundamental tool for professional development of graduates of vocational and higher education institutions is developed.</p> <p>7.1 proven; 7.2 non-trivial; 7.3 the provision is new; 7.4 level of application: wide 7.5 proven and substantiated by a scientific article.</p>
8.	Principle of Credibility	8.1 Choice of methodology - is the methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail:	The research methodology is sufficiently justified and disclosed in detail in the theoretical and analytical chapters.
	Credibility of sources and provided information	1)yes;	
		2) no.	The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies: SPSS, Smart PLS.
		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies:	
		1) yes;	

		2) no.	
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, revealed interrelations and regularities are proved and confirmed by experimental research (for the directions of training in pedagogical sciences the results are proved on the basis of pedagogical experiment):	Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research.
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no.	
		8.4 Important assertions are <u>supported</u> /partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.	Important claims are supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature.
		8.5 Used literature sources <u>are sufficient</u> /not sufficient for a literature review.	The bibliographic base of the study is sufficient and includes 148.
9	Principle of practical value	9.1 The thesis has theoretical significance:	The dissertation has theoretical significance.
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no.	
		9.2 The dissertation is of practical significance and there is a high probability that the obtained results will be applied in practice:	The dissertation has practical significance and there is a high probability of applying the obtained results in practice.
		1) <u>yes</u> ;	
		2) no.	
		9.3 Are the practice offerings new:	The practical offerings are completely new.
		1) <u>completely new</u> ;	
		2) partially new (25-75% are new);	
10.	Quality of writing and design	3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The dissertation is written in scientific language with a logically
		The quality of academic writing is	
		1) <u>high</u> ;	

		2) average;	structured and cohesive content. The quality of academic writing is marked by a high standard of presentation.
		3) below average;	
		4) low.	
11.	Comments on the dissertation	The dissertation is a highly qualified scientific work that demonstrates a deep understanding of the research topic and original approaches. The theoretical contributions are well-developed, offering new insights into youth employment issues. The methodology applied is rigorous and appropriate, ensuring reliable results. The empirical foundation is strong, enhancing the practical value of the findings. The structure of the work is clear and logical, making it easy to follow the development of the research. The practical implications of the study are significant, especially in proposing actionable recommendations for improving youth employment in Kazakhstan. Overall, the dissertation represents a valuable contribution to both academic knowledge and practical applications in the field of youth employment.	
12.	Scientific level of doctoral student's articles on the topic of research (in case of thesis defense in the form of a series of articles, official reviewers comment on the scientific level of each doctoral student's article on the topic of research)	The articles presented by the candidate demonstrate a high scientific level, reflecting deep understanding and thorough analysis of the research issue. Each article is well-grounded in modern scientific theories, showcasing original ideas and a significant contribution to the field. The empirical basis of the studies is robust, and the methodology applied is rigorous, ensuring the reliability and validity of the results. Overall, the candidate's work meets the highest academic standards, highlighting their strong research capabilities.	
13.	Decision of the official reviewer (in accordance with paragraph 28 of the Standard Provisions)	The dissertation work of Buitek Elvira Kazybekbikyzy on the topic «Youth employment of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the conditions of modern global challenges: priorities and mechanisms » meets the requirements for dissertations for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04101 – «Economics».	

Official Reviewer,
Cand. Sc. (Econ.),
Associate Professor of Almaty
Humanitarian-Economic University

30.04.2025



Yeshpanova D.D.
