

**Review of the official reviewer
on the dissertation work of Soldatenko Tatyana Anatolevna
«The impact of customer intelligence on the marketing performance
of Small and Medium Enterprises: a practical application»
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
on the educational program 8D04106 – «Marketing»**

№	Criteria	Compliance with criteria (one of the answer options should be marked)	Justification of the official reviewer's position
1.	The topic of the dissertation (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of scientific development and/or state programs	<p>1.1 Compliance with priority directions of science development or state programs:</p> <p>1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (specify the name and number of the project or program)</p> <p>2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of another state program (specify the name of the program)</p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify the direction)</p>	<p>The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development «Advanced production, digital and space technologies», the goals of the Strategy «Kazakhstan-2050»; national project on the development of entrepreneurship for 2021-2025.</p> <p>2) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of the National Project «Development of Entrepreneurship for 2021-2025», October 12, 2021.</p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of science development, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan: «Advanced production, digital and space technologies», as well as the Concept of Science Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022 - 2026, approved by the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2022 № 336: item «8) research in the field of social and human sciences».</p>
2.	Importance for science	The work <u>does/does not make</u> a significant contribution to science and its importance is <u>well-disclosed/not disclosed</u>	The author's definitions and conceptual models, proposed by the dissertant, supplement the existing concepts of creation and use of customer intelligence (CI). The work makes a significant contribution to science, as methodological provisions and practical recommendations on the use of CI model, strategy of its creation and efficiency of its application in

			<p>SMEs, which are aimed at improving the effectiveness of their marketing activities, are developed.</p> <p>The importance of the research topic for economic science is well disclosed. The significance of the work is well substantiated both in the choice of the research topic and in the set goal and objectives.</p>
3.	Principle of autonomy	<p>Level of autonomy:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>High</u>; 2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) No independence 	<p>The high degree of independence of the research is evidenced by the author's judgments in the work, own formulations of the definition of CI, conceptual model of its creation and use, clarity of conclusions, scientific validity of the presented recommendations.</p> <p>The high degree of independence of the study is confirmed by the presence of publications on the results of the study in highly rated journals included in the Scopus database, as well as in the list of journals recommended by the CQASHE of MSHE of the RK.</p>
4.	Principle of internal unity	<p>4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>Justified</u>; 2) Partially justified; 3) Not substantiated. 	<p>The topic of the dissertation is actual and substantiated with regard to scientific and practical relevance. The scientific significance is justified by the need to development of proposals and recommendations for further improvement of construction and application of CI methodology as a necessary basis for decision-making and increasing the effectiveness of marketing.</p> <p>The relevance of the research on the impact of CI on the marketing activities of SMEs is also confirmed by the lack of development of the topic by Kazakhstani scientists.</p>
		<p>4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the dissertation topic:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>Reflects</u>; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect. 	<p>The content of the thesis reflects the topic and fully discloses the essence of the problem under study.</p> <p>The wording of the titles of the sections corresponds to the objectives of the study. The main content of the work is characterized by the presence of the author's own opinion on the issues considered in the work, the presence of author's recommendations.</p>

		<p>4.3. The purpose and objectives are consistent with the thesis topic:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>correspond to</u>; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond. 	<p>The aim and objectives fully correspond to the topic of the thesis, the achievement of which is realized by investigating the impact of CI on the effectiveness of marketing activities of SMEs and assessing the effectiveness of its application.</p>
		<p>4.4 All sections and statements of the thesis are logically interrelated:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>fully interrelated</u>; 2) partially interrelated; 3) there is no interrelation. 	<p>All sections and provisions of the dissertation are fully interconnected and organized in a logical sequence. The dissertation work is characterized by internal unity, consistency of theoretical-methodological, methodological and empirical sections, is a logical, consistent presentation of the material with appropriate conclusions.</p>
		<p>4.5 New solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>there is critical analysis</u>; 2) the analysis is partial; 3) the analysis is not the author's own opinions, but quotes from other authors. 	<p>The new solutions proposed by the author are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions on the basis of a critical and systematic analysis of existing opinions and views. The work traces the dissertant's focus on the search for objective knowledge, which is expressed in the review of a significant amount of scientific publications on the topic of the study and confirms the presence of critical analysis.</p>
5.	Principle of scientific novelty	<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new</u> (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new). 	<p>The scientific results and provisions are partially new (at the 75% level), as they are based on a review of the findings and results of previously conducted research and are accompanied by the dissertant's own scientific analysis and confirmed by his own empirical research.</p>
		<p>5.2 The conclusions of the thesis are new?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new</u> (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new) 	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation contain scientifically based theoretical results and complex analysis, which can be recognized as partially new, because in the work on the basis of the use of known techniques and methods the dissertant independently confirmed the existing regularities, proved and supplemented the existing scientific theories.</p>
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or managerial decisions are new and reasonable:</p>	<p>Economic and managerial solutions are completely new, as they contain the results of qualitative research and analysis of the impact of CI on the</p>

		<p>1) <u>completely new</u>; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>effectiveness of marketing activities of SMEs. Technical and technological solutions are also completely new, as they are based on the construction of economic and statistical model using Smart PLS 4 application.</p>
6.	The validity of the main conclusions	<p>All major conclusions <u>are/are not based on</u> scientifically rigorous evidence or <u>are reasonably well supported</u> (for qualitative research and arts and humanities training areas).</p>	<p>The main conclusions formulated within the framework of the dissertation research are fully justified, meet the criteria of objectivity and evidence, which is expressed in the conduct of a comprehensive theoretical review, the analysis of accumulated practical experience on the topic of research, the use of economic and mathematical methods in substantiating their own proposals.</p>
7.	The main provisions submitted for defense	<p>The following questions need to be answered for each provision individually: 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven. 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; 2) no. 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 2) no. 7.4 Level for application: 1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide. 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes; 2) no.</p>	<p><i>Provision 1 «author's CI definition and its conceptual model for applications in SMEs»</i> 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven. 7.2 Is the provision trivial? 2) no. 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes. 7.4 Level for application: 2) wide. 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes. The provision is proven in the articles «From customer intelligence to sustainability: management feature of SMEs in Almaty City» (2023); «Modern aspects and trends of Customer Intelligence development» (2020). <i>Provision 2 «scientific results on the economic efficiency of marketing in SMEs through the application of CI using a mixed research method»</i> 7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven. 7.2 Is the provision trivial? 2) no. 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes. 7.4 Level for application: 2) wide. 7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p>

			<p>1) yes. The provision is proven in the article «From customer intelligence to sustainability: management feature of SMEs in Almaty City» (2023).</p> <p><i>Provision 3 «economical-statistical model of CI factors influencing the effectiveness of SME marketing activities based on data analysis in SmartPLS 4»</i></p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven.</p> <p>7.2 Is the provision trivial? 2) no.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) yes.</p> <p>7.4 Level for application: 2) wide.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) no.</p> <p>The position is proven in the article, that has not yet been published, but is in print.</p> <p><i>Provision 4 «practical recommendation in form of strategy for the creation and implementation of CI at SMEs»</i></p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven.</p> <p>7.2 Is the provision trivial? 2) no.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) yes.</p> <p>7.4 Level for application: 2) wide.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p> <p>The provision is proven in the articles «Эффективность применения карты клиентского пути: практический кейс казахстанской компании МСП» (2023); «Путь клиента как инструмент улучшения клиентского опыта в малом и среднем бизнесе» (2022); «Панель KPI для задач Customer Intelligence: применение и значение для бизнеса» (2022).</p> <p><i>Provision 5 «calculations on the economic efficiency of marketing</i></p>
--	--	--	--

			<p><i>activities through the implementation of CI»</i></p> <p>7.1 Is the provision proven? 1) proven.</p> <p>7.2 Is the provision trivial? 2) no.</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) yes.</p> <p>7.4 Level for application: 2) wide.</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p> <p>The provision is proven in the article «Эффективность применения карты клиентского пути: практический кейс казахстанской компании МСП» (2023).</p>
8.	Principle of Credibility Credibility of sources and provided information	8.1 Choice of methodology - is the methodology justified or is the methodology described in sufficient detail: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The dissertation provides justification for the use of the applied research approaches. The methodological basis of the dissertation was formed by theoretical and empirical research methods, detailed description of which is given in accordance with the issues under consideration and the realization of the set tasks. In conducting the online survey and in-depth interview, the sampling and data processing methods are justified.
		8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and techniques of data processing and interpretation with the use of computer technologies: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research (statistical, quantitative and qualitative research, including in-depth interview, online survey), as well as data processing techniques using computer technology, which allowed to qualitatively evaluate a large amount of data, significantly increase the objectivity and reliability of the obtained results. The dissertant made extensive use of SmartPLS 4 software for data processing, graphical tools and Excel spreadsheet formulas in modeling the impact of CI on the effectiveness of SME marketing activities.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, revealed interrelations and regularities are proved and confirmed by experimental research (for the directions	Theoretical conclusions, revealed interrelationships and regularities are proved and confirmed by an experimental study and independently conducted empirical research based on an online survey of

		of training in pedagogical sciences the results are proved on the basis of pedagogical experiment): 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	company marketers and in-depth interviews with SME experts.
		8.4 Important assertions <u>are supported</u> /partially supported/not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature	Important statements are supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature, accompanied by their critical analysis and conclusions of the author. The used literary sources cover an extensive time period, represent a significant geographical breadth of research, which allows us to judge the comprehensive validity of the findings.
		8.5 Used literature sources <u>are sufficient</u> /not sufficient for a literature review	The used literature sources are sufficient for the literature review (250 sources in total) and include monographs, scientific articles from rating databases (Web of Science, Scopus, Springer, etc.), articles recommended by the CQASHE, materials of international conferences, etc.
9	Principle of practical value	9.1 The thesis has theoretical significance: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The dissertation is of theoretical importance, as it makes a significant contribution to the development of a number of theoretical provisions and develops the level of their comprehension. The author presents the conceptual basis for the use of CI methodology and its tools, conducts a comparative analysis of foreign authors' opinions, on the basis of which she formulates its own definition and develops theoretical and methodological approaches to the formation of CI for SMEs.
		9.2 The dissertation is of practical significance and there is a high probability that the obtained results will be applied in practice: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The scientific results obtained by the author have practical significance and can be used by SME firms to improve the efficiency of their marketing activities. The practical significance of the research results is confirmed by two acts of implementation and a visual example of creating a customer journey map attached to the thesis.
		9.3 Are the practice offerings new?	The proposals for practice are completely new. The author's

		1) <u>completely new</u> ; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	recommendations on the use of the author's conceptual model of CI development and application in SMEs, the strategy of creation and implementation of CI in SMEs, as well as the determination of economic efficiency of marketing through the introduction of CI are developed for the first time.
10.	Quality of writing and design	The quality of academic writing is: 1) <u>high</u> ; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The quality of writing and design of the dissertation work is high. The dissertation work is characterized by a high degree of quality of academic writing, which is determined by the accurate use of scientific terminology (in particular, in a foreign language), stylistically competent, linguistically and logically correct presentation of the material. The high quality of the dissertation design is confirmed by the use of visual illustrative material in the form of graphs, schemes, tables, diagrams.

Dissertation work of Soldatenko Tatyana Anatolevna on the topic «The impact of customer intelligence on the marketing performance of Small and Medium Enterprises: a practical application» meets the requirements of Chapter 2 of the «Rules for Awarding Degrees» for dissertations for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), and its author deserves to be awarded the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the educational program 8D04106 – «Marketing».

Official Reviewer,
 Candidate of economic sciences,
 Associate Professor of HAC,
 research professor of
 «Turan» University



Davletova M.T.

01.03.2024

