

REVIEW
from the official reviewer
for dissertation work of Soldatenko Tatyana Anatolevna
on the topic "The impact of customer intelligence on the marketing performance of Small
and Medium Enterprises: a practical application", submitted
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)
in the specialty "8D04106 - Marketing".

№	Criteria	Compliance with the criteria (mark one of the given options)	Justification for the official reviewer's position
1	The dissertation topic (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of science development and / or state programs	<p>Compliance with priority areas of science development or State programs:</p> <p>1) The dissertation was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the State budget (indicate the name and number of the project/program).</p> <p>2) <u>The dissertation was completed within the framework of National project "Entrepreneurship Development for 2021-2025" and Strategy "Kazakhstan-2050."</u></p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the science development, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (specify direction).</p>	<p>The topic of the dissertation corresponds to President Kassym-Jomart Tokayev's State of the Nation Address "Economic course of a Just Kazakhstan", dated 09/01/2023, and also National project "Entrepreneurship Development for 2021-2025", October 12, 2021.</p> <p>In general, the conceptual results of the study can be applied when modernizing the Kazakhstan 2050 Strategy.</p>
2	Significance for science	The work <u>makes</u> / does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is <u>well disclosed</u> / not disclosed	<p>The dissertation research makes a significant contribution to science, which is due to the relevance of such problems under consideration as sustainable and competitive development of SMEs through increasing the efficiency of marketing activities based on the use of Customer Intelligence.</p> <p>The author substantiates the following scientific results:</p> <p>– theoretical concepts of Customer Intelligence and marketing effectiveness based on analysis of foreign and domestic sources;</p>

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the relationship between the use of Customer Intelligence and its tools with marketing effectiveness; - customer conceptual model developed Customer Intelligence to improve the effectiveness of marketing activities and the efficiency of the enterprise; - a practical recommendation in form of strategy for the development and implementation of Customer Intelligence in SMEs has been devised; - calculations on the economic efficiency of marketing activities through the implementation of Customer Intelligence were made.
3	The principle of independence/objectivity	<p>Independence level:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>High</u>; 2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) There is no independence 	<p>The high level of independence of the dissertation study is evidenced by a detailed consideration of the problem in several directions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - theoretical, in terms of disclosure of the content and definition of the essence, features and specifics of customer intelligence; - conceptual, in terms of determining the impact of customer intelligence on the marketing efficiency; - analytical, in terms of conducting analysis of the status of customer intelligence in SME subjects of Almaty; - experimental, in terms of conducting a survey of Kazakhstani marketing experts on the analysis of the marketing activities of SMEs; - applied, in terms of development of the author's "the CI creating model".
4	The principal of internal unity	<p>4.1 Rationale for the relevance of the dissertation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Justified; 2) <u>Partially justified</u>; 3) Not justified 	<p>The relevance of the research topic is partially justified.</p> <p>It is necessary to indicate the importance of the entrepreneurship development at a national scale.</p>
		<p>4.2 The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>Reflects</u>; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect 	<p>The content of the dissertation reflects the topic of the dissertation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the general content of the main part reveals the topic of the study. - the names of the structural sections of the chapters of the dissertation are formulated correctly in compliance with the logic of presentation, do not go beyond the limits outlined by the title of the chapters. - conducted theoretical review, empirical studies fully correspond to the declared topic of the dissertation work.

		<p>4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>comply</u>; 2) partially correspond; 3) do not match 	<p>The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the dissertation and reveal all the main aspects of the stated research topic, which made it possible to obtain relevant results confirming the need to create and implement Customer Intelligence on SMEs.</p> <p>In the same time, the theoretical chapter of the dissertation does not sufficiently address the implementation of Customer Intelligence in SMEs and its impact on improving the effectiveness of marketing for small and medium-sized enterprises.</p>
		<p>4.4 All sections and subsections of the dissertation are logically interconnected:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>are fully interconnected</u>; 2) the relationship is partial; 3) there is no relationship 	<p>The dissertation work is based on logically related theoretical and practical propositions that allowed the author to achieve internal unity of results. The dissertation has a clear logical structure, on the basis of which the author consistently develops the main provisions in the context of the proposed goal and assigned tasks. The logic of the dissertation research, built on a step-by-step transition from the general scientific analysis of consumer theories behavior, relationship marketing, marketing attribution, decision-making theory, and performance indicators before developing the author's approaches to the formation of Customer Intelligence in modern conditions, allowed the author to develop effective and practical recommendations.</p>
		<p>4.5 New solutions proposed by the author (principles, methods) are argued and evaluated in comparison with known solutions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) <u>there is a critical analysis</u>; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis is not one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors 	<p>Conclusions were drawn from each section of the dissertation, which consists of a critical analysis of the theory of Customer Intelligence, its impact on the effectiveness of marketing activities, as well as the author's own opinion on the issues under consideration. Thus, the author discovered the absence of a Customer Intelligence creation model with the tools used, and strategies for its implementation.</p>
5	The principle of scientific novelty	<p>5.1 Are scientific results and statements new?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) completely new; 2) <u>partly new (25-75% are new)</u> 3) not new (less than 25% are new) 	<p>The results of the study are partially new, since they are based on the results of previous studies conducted by foreign scientists, which contributed to the development of the theory of Customer Intelligence.</p>
		<p>5.2 Are the conclusions of the dissertation new?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) completely new; 	<p>The conclusions of the dissertation are partially new, since the author refers to the results of previous studies when justifying the conclusions of the other authors.</p>

		<p>2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u></p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and justified:</p> <p>1) <u>completely new</u>;</p> <p>2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u></p> <p>3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	<p>Economic and management solutions are completely new, because contain a number of analytical results of the in-depth interview, an online survey.</p> <p>Technical and technological solutions are determined by the using SmartPLS 4.</p>
6	Validity of the main conclusions	<p>All key findings are <u>based</u>/not based on scientifically sound evidence, or reasonably well-founded (for qualitative research and arts and humanities courses)</p>	<p>The dissertation presents significant empirical works, which confirms the reliability of the results obtained. In addition, the reliability and validity of scientific provisions is confirmed by the genesis study of the concept of Customer Intelligence.</p> <p>All the main findings and conclusions of the applicant formulated in the dissertation research are scientifically substantiated. They rely on scientifically significant literary sources and empirical data, as well as on the analytical tools and software products used:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the conclusions of results one and two are justified because they are based on the analysis of primary data and bibliographic analysis of marketing theories; - conclusions of results tree and four are substantiated using methods of statistical processing and analysis of primary information collected using an online survey and in-depth interview; - the conclusions of result five are justified because they were obtained through analysis of a wide range of practical data and global development trends Customer Intelligence; - the conclusions of result six are justified because they were obtained based on the analysis of primary information obtained at SMEs in Almaty
7	Basic propositions for defence	<p>The following questions need to be answered for each proposition separately:</p> <p>7.1 Is the proposition proven?</p> <p>1) <u>proven</u>;</p> <p>2) rather proven;</p> <p>3) rather unproven;</p> <p>4) not proven</p>	<p>7.1 The main provisions submitted for defense have an appropriate evidence base, distributed across levels: cognitive, functional and systemic:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the first position put forward for defense is confirmed by the analysis and generalization of the basic scientific concepts about Customer Intelligence and Marketing Effectiveness. The theoretical basis of the

		<p>7.2 Is it trivial? 1) yes; 2) <u>no</u></p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no</p> <p>7.4 Level to apply: 1) narrow; 2) <u>medium</u>; 3) wide</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no</p>	<p>first position of the dissertation allowed the researcher to reflect various modern approaches and present the author's vision of the concept of Customer Intelligence and develop its conceptual model;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the second and third provisions put forward for defense are proven based on testing hypotheses using correlation and regression analysis, performed using modern data processing programs SmartPLS 4, Atlasti And NVivo . The evidence base of the study is placed on the analysis of primary information received from market participants during a survey and in-depth interviews; - the fourth position is justified by the results obtained by the author in practical activities on the implementation of the Customer Intelligence model, international trends in the development of it and the Kazakhstan realities of the SMEs development; - the fifth point put forward for defense is justified by the economic results obtained by the author from implementing Customer Intelligence at SMEs Almaty. <p>7.2 The main provisions put forward for defense are quite unique because:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the first provision submitted for defense, is formed based on the use of analysis and synthesis of scientific literature, empirical research, as well as practical experience; - the second and third defenses are based on MMR, a combination of quantitative and qualitative research methods; - the fourth and fifth provisions put forward for defense were developed based on practical experience and adaptation of international experience to Kazakhstan practice. <p>Thus, the new approaches used in the dissertation research determine the non-triviality of its main provisions.</p> <p>7.3 The first position put forward for defense is new, since the author generalized well-known theories to formulate his own conceptual model;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the second and third provisions submitted for protection are new, since for the first time in Kazakhstan the level of influence of the Customer Intelligence was
--	--	---	---

			<p>assessed on the effectiveness of marketing activities;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the fourth point put forward for the defense is new, since the author for the first time generalized his own experience in implementing Customer Intelligence on SMEs Almaty; - the fifth provision of the defense is new, since the author for the first time in Kazakhstan conducted an economic assessment of the use of Customer Intelligence on the effectiveness of the company's marketing activities. <p>7.4 The provisions of the dissertation submitted for defense have a wide level of application, since the conclusions and results obtained can be used by SMEs operating in various sectors of the economy.</p> <p>7.5 The first provision put forward for defense is reflected in the article "From Customer Intelligence to sustainability: management feature of SMEs in Almaty", in 2023, in Journal of Strategic Marketing, as well as in the article "Modern aspects and trends of Customer Intelligence development" in the journal Economics: Strategy and Practice (2020).</p> <p>Second position found reflection in article "From Customer Intelligence to sustainability: management feature of SMEs in Almaty", 2023 in the Journal of Strategic Marketing.</p> <p>On the fourth and fifth provisions, the following articles were published: "The customer journey as a tool for improving customer experience in small and medium-sized businesses", 2022, in the journal "Marketing and Marketing Research"; "The effectiveness of using a customer journey map: a practical case of a Kazakh SME company" in the journal Bulletin of "Turan" University, 2023, as well as the article "KPI dashboard for Customer Intelligence tasks: application and significance for business" in the journal Bulletin of "Turan" University, in 2022.</p>
8	The principle of reliability. Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology is justified or methodology described in sufficient detail 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The research methods used are justified and detailed in accordance with the specific objectives of the study and are aimed at performing specific operations. The author is quite scrupulous in determining the survey sample, scientifically justification of the

		<p>number of respondents, as well as the formation of the questionnaire.</p> <p>The sequence of stages of the study is well developed and detailed at each stage, clearly defining all the necessary key steps. New approaches were used to process statistical data, and a combination of several research methods was used, which increases the reliability of the results obtained.</p> <p>The correct choice of research methods made it possible to ensure the receipt of objective, accurate, systematized information aimed at testing the hypotheses of the study.</p>
	<p>8.2 The results of the dissertation work were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies:</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no</p>	<p>The work used modern quantitative (online survey) and qualitative research methods (in-depth interviews), as well as analytical tools for assessing the collected information using software products:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - content analysis in data analysis programs Atlasti and NVivo; - correlation and regression analysis in the data analysis program SmartPLS 4; - building mind maps in Mindjet MindManager.
	<p>8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns are proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results are proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment):</p> <p>1) <u>yes</u>; 2) no</p>	<p>The results of the study, the identified relationships and patterns, conclusions and models are substantiated and confirmed by the results of an empirical study, the results of which are interpreted in accordance with the accepted criteria.</p> <p>At the same time, I think that based on the analysis in section 3.1, recommendations should have been provided to enhance the impact of the identified factors, including the Feedback system and Loyalty program, contributing to the improvement of marketing effectiveness.</p>
	<p>8.4 Important statements are <u>supported</u> / partially confirmed / not supported by references to relevant and reliable scientific literature</p>	<p>Important statements are supported by the literature review cited in the reference list, as well as the results obtained from data processing by analysis program SmartPLS 4.</p>
	<p>8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient / <u>not sufficient</u> for a literature review</p>	<p>The total number of literature sources used is 250, and 66 of which have been published at the last 5 years. At the same time, it should be noted that the number of works by Kazakhstani authors is insufficient to fully assess the situation with the conditions for the formation and development of SMEs in the country, as</p>

			well as the development of marketing theory and practice.
9	The principle of practical significance	9.1 The dissertation has a theoretical value: 1) <u>yes</u> 2) no	The study develops the theoretical principles and methodological foundations of the Customer Intelligence concept and marketing efficiency, which is relevant for the development of SMEs in Kazakhstan and complements existing theoretical research. The results obtained by the author can be used in further research on this direction and even included in the curriculum of university educational programs. However, the effectiveness of the work would significantly increase if the author recommended and tested in sections 3.3 their own methodology for assessing the economic efficiency of CI in SMEs based on the studied methods and their adaptation to the researched sphere.
		9.2 The dissertation is of practical importance and there is a high probability of applying the results obtained in practice: 1) <u>yes</u> ; 2) no	The practical significance of the dissertation research is the development of a conceptual model of Customer Intelligence, as well as in creating a Customer Intelligence implementation strategy, which can be successfully applied to SMEs in Kazakhstan. The research results are of interest to commercial and enterprises in Kazakhstan, at the same time, the research results obtained by the applicant can be widely used in the educational process.
		9.3 Are the suggestions for practice new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partly new (25-75% are new)</u> ; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	The presented proposals for practice are partly new, since there are large companies that are already successfully using Customer Intelligence.
10	Quality of writing and design	Quality of academic writing: 1) <u>high</u> 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The work is written in a scientific style and meets the requirements. The quality of academic writing is acceptable, the text is presented in accessible language. There are some small isolated stylistic errors in the dissertation, which do not detract from the quality of academic writing as a whole.

However, tagged shortcomings are advisory in nature and do not affect the overall positive assessment. Comments are wishes for the applicant for the future.

The dissertation research on the topic: "The impact of Customer Intelligence on the marketing performance of SMEs: a practical application" is carried out on a current topic, is a completed scientific work, prepared independently by the author and contains scientifically based results, the use of which is aimed at solving applied problems of the national economy in development of the SMEs. I recommend petitioning the Committee to award doctoral student Tatyana Anatolyevna Soldatenko the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in specialty 8D04106 - "Marketing".

**Official reviewer,
Doctor of Economics,
Ass. Professor, Chief Researcher,
Institute of Economics of the
Science Committee of the
Ministry of Education and Science**



A.T. Tleuberdinova

А.Т. Тлеубердинова
— 11 —
Қолым растаймын.
ҚР Ғылым және жоғары білім министрлігі
Ғылым комитетінің
«Экономика институты» ШДЖК РМК
Кадр қызметі *Кемелова А.К.*